Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

WORKSHOP

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

INTEGRATED WASTE MANAGEMENT BOARD

FOOD WASTE DIVERSION AT LARGE PUBLIC VENUES

JOE SERNA JR., CALEPA HEADQUARTERS BUILDING

1001 I STREET

2ND FLOOR, BYRON SHER AUDITORIUM

SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA

WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 8, 2004

1:00 P.M.

JAMES F. PETERS, CSR, RPR
CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER
LICENSE NUMBER 10063

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

APPEARANCES

PANEL MEMBERS

Mr. John Beerman, Sales & Marketing Director, California Bio-Mass, Inc.

Mr. Jack Macy, Commercial Recycling Coordinator, City/County of San Francisco

Ms. Rosemary Mindiola, Recycling Specialist, Desert Sands Unified School District

Mr. William O'Toole, Owner, EcoNomics

Ms. Frankie Riddle, Recycling Coordinator, City of Palm Desert

Mr. Steven Sherman, President, Applied Compost Consulting, Inc.

Ms. Valerie Ward, Recycling Coordinator, Waste Management of the Desert

Mr. Christopher Williams, Consultant, Applied Compost Consulting, Inc.

STAFF

Mr. Pat Schiavo, Deputy Director

Mr. Terry Brennan

Ms. Chris Kinsella

Mr. Trevor O'Shaughnessy

Mr. Chris Schmidle

CIWMB BOARD MEMBERS

Ms. Rosalie Mul

Mr. Michael Paparian

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

INDEX

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

PROCEEDINGS

DEPUTY DIRECTOR SCHIAVO: Welcome to our workshop today. I'd like to just give some brief opening notes and then Board Member Paparian will address you.

Today's agenda -- and it's up on the screen here and I'm going to read it briefly because of the people listening in on the webcast.

From 1:15 to 1:30 we're going to have a discussion on AB 2176 and the large venue and organic materials resources that are on the website.

And from 1:30 to 2:10 we'll have a presentation on the San Francisco Giants SBC Park food waste diversion program.

2:10 to 2:50 -- we have a real precise schedule -- 2:10 to 2:50 we're going to have a presentation on the Desert Sands Unified School District food waste diversion program. Also have a short presentation at tomorrow's committee meeting.

And we're going to take a break at 2:50 to 3 o'clock, and then we'll reconvene.

And at 3 o'clock we'll have a presentation on the Indian Wells Tennis Gardens food waste diversion program.

And then we'll have questions and answers and a wrap up.

You know, as you can see, we'll have one

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

scheduled break after the second panel. And we'd appreciate it if you'd hold all the questions until after the third panel. And then we'll have our questions and answers session after that.

Then the important information is the restrooms are out these doors to the left, for those of you unfamiliar with the building. And then downstairs we have a snack area so you can get something if you get hungry.

As far as handouts, we have four different handouts in the back of the room. One of those deals with panelists contact information. The other is a description of AB 2176 requirements. And then we have Food Waste Diversion at Special Events fact sheet as well as a few bookmarks that list food waste diversion website information.

For those on the web, you can actively participate in this workshop and you can do it via E-mail. And send your E-mails and questions to C -- it's CKINSELL. And it's C-K-I-N-S-E-L-L at C-I-W-M-B dot C-A dot Gov. And put "Food Waste Workshop on your "Subject" line so that we know what you're sending us the E-mail about.

So that's it for these introductory remarks. And I'm pleased to introduce Board Member Paparian, who's going to give you a few words with the roving mic over here.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: The roving mic?

DEPUTY DIRECTOR SCHIAVO: Or do you want to use this one?

BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: I can use this.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR SCHIAVO: Okay. We're going to be flexible.

BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Welcome. This is now the Byron Sher Auditorium. And if you're curious at all --

(Applause.)

BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: -- who Byron Sher is, there's his picture in the back of the room and a little information about all the great things that he did during his career in the Senate.

(Thereupon an overhead presentation was Presented as follows.)

BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Since we're talking about the San Francisco Giants SBC Park, I asked Pat if we could also bring up the Cal Bears. He said, no, we're talking about the park and not the team. So I'll leave my comments about the Rose Bowl out of this.

Thank you all for being here today. Thank you all who are listening in on the webcast. And a big thank you to our panelists from San Francisco, Palm Desert, Indian Wells, and everybody here for your participation in this.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Let me just do a quick check. I'm curious -- I know a lot of you here, but not everybody. How many of you are from local government?

(Hands raised.)

BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Good, good, good. From the public-venue-related industry, anybody?

(Hands raised.)

BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Yeah. All right, all right. You're going to be a popular guy in a little bit.

Haulers and composters or their representatives?

(Hands Raised.)

BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Yeah.

Schools? Anybody from the schools?

(Hands Raised.)

BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Yeah. Great.

State agencies in AB 75 staff, including the Waste Board? I know there's a lot of us here.

(Hands Raised.)

And others, public?

(Hands Raised.)

BOARD MEMBER PAPARIAN: Yeah, yeah.

Gary of course wears multiple hats as usual.

Well, thank you. It looks like a great audience. I'm sure a lot of interest, I know, is out there, folks listening in. I'm sure we'll get some comments, as Pat

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

mentioned, folks writing in on E-mail who may have some questions or commence.

Before we get started I wanted to say a few words about why we're here today hosting this workshop.

First of all, food waste diversion is a multifaceted topic. We're looking at just one segment of that today, food waste diversion at large public venues. There are other aspects of food waste diversion that we're obviously not going to get into today, but we'll be getting into in the future.

We know that food waste can be a large part of any jurisdiction's waste stream. Our waste characterization studies indicate that it can be about 16 percent statewide, or typically about half of the organics component of the waste stream; and perhaps even higher than that, 18 percent or more if the jurisdiction has a large public venue or a large facility of some sort that is producing a lot of food processing or food waste.

For jurisdictions with large venues, food waste diversion can be challenging. But dealing with it is really necessary in order to meet the diversion goals of AB 939. We know that many jurisdictions are host to large venues and have questions about how best to target that waste. And since the Board is charged with assisting jurisdictions to implement diversion programs, we felt it

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

would be helpful to provide this forum for sharing information on food waste diversion programs at large public venues, especially those that have been particularly successful at this.

That's why we asked today's panelists, representing three large venues, to share with you their expertise and insights on what works and what doesn't when targeting that waste stream; and how they have successfully met the challenge of diverting their large venue food waste, what plans they have for the future, and how the program benefits from -- benefits the local jurisdictions as well as the venues.

The panel members represent only a few of the many players of a team that make up the food waste diversion program statewide. For example, without the cooperation of the industry related to food waste, like composters and haulers, food waste would not be diverted. Representatives from these industries are therefore also on the panel to share their insights and experiences with working with local governments that have large public venue waste diversion programs.

I want to say how glad I am to be here today to see all of you here to share in this workshop. And I especially want to again thank the panelists.

I also want to give special notice to our staff,

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Pat Schiavo oh and the Diversion Planning and Local Assistance staff. They've been doing a fabulous job of trying to get their hands around this issue and trying to figure out what we can do as a state agency to help promote additional food diversion from large venues, and I think they've been doing a great job of that.

So we appreciate you being here today. And hopefully we'll all learn quite a bit about what we can accomplish.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR SCHIAVO: Thanks, Mike.

I'd like to take this time now to introduce Chris Kinsella. And she's going to be the moderator for the show. And again I'd like echo what Mike said. And thanks to all the staff who took the time to put this on. It was a lot of work. And it's going to be very successful.

So here you go, Chris.

MS. KINSELLA: Hi. Good morning -- or good afternoon. I'm Chris Kinsella.

I first want to mention that, for the listening audience and everyone else, all the presentations that we'll have today will be on our website under "Board Meetings". And then you can pull up this particular workshop.

I now have the pleasure of introducing two Board staff, Chris Schmidle and Terry Brennan.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

MR. SCHMIDLE: Hello. I'm Chris Schmidle, Board staff member. And I've been working on the venues and recycling issue for several years now.

(Thereupon an overhead presentation was Presented as follows.)

MR. SCHMIDLE: At the end of September of 2004, our Governor signed a new law to encourage operators of large venues and events in California to increase waste reduction, reuse, recycling, and a purchase of recycled content materials.

Like most bills, AB 2176 can be a little difficult, complicated to interpret. So we have provided a handout today that reorganizes the information. It's called General Description of AB 2176. It was in the back. If you don't have a copy, put your hand up and we'll have a staff member bring you one.

You can take a look at this information at your leisure. But for now let's take a quick and simplified look at who is covered by this new act and what their major responsibilities are.

--o0o--

MR. SCHMIDLE: There's a two-part test to determine which facilities and events are subject to the Act's requirements.

First, you must be considered large as defined in

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

the Act. As you can see, there are two separate definitions for large event and large venue. The large event charges an admission and has an average of 2,000 attendees and employees per day of the event. The large venue uses an annual average of 2,000 attendees and employees on the site per day of operation.

--o0o--

MR. SCHMIDLE: Second, of all the large venues and events in a city or county, only the largest 10 percent as determined by annual waste generation tonnage are mandated by the planning and reporting provisions of this Act.

So basically this lets out the small venues and events, you know, the weddings, the softball tournament in the park. It really concentrates on the large venues in your community.

--o0o--

MR. SCHMIDLE: If are you among the largest 10 percent of venues and events in your city or county, you must develop a waste reduction plan and a time line, implement the plan programs and actions, and report your progress annually to your local government.

Some of the strategies to reduce waste encouraged by the Act include, but are not limited to, designing for waste reduction and facilities construction and operation,

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

such as buying products with returnable or recyclable packaging; developing partnerships for materials reuse with community groups, such as good banks; renegotiating waste handling contracts to promote recycling; and renegotiating your purchasing contracts to select products made from recycled content materials.

Now, there are specific dates and times in the law completing these various tasks, and more information is in the handout. And you'll be hearing more about the workable strategies from our panelists today.

--o0o--

MR. SCHMIDLE: For those of you in local government, if you are a city or county, you also have responsibilities under the act, such as identifying the large venues and events in your community and working with them in specific ways. For example, when you issue an operating or use permit to any large venue or event, you must supply them with information about how to divert their wastes and the diversion resources available in your community.

The city or county is encouraged to assist the qualifying largest 10 percent of large venues in developing their waste reduction plan and must collect information on the largest venues and events waste reduction progress in meeting their own chosen goals.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

This information will be reported annually to the Board, along with the jurisdiction's other waste diversion program data, in the annual report that you use to meet the AB 939 requirements.

Each city or county must also check to be sure that there is sufficient space for recyclables when issuing a permit for a commercial or industrial development. This covers all development projects, not just venues or events facilities.

The act also states that cities and counties may charge a fee to the venues or events for their services.

--o0o--

MR. SCHMIDLE: The California Integrated Waste Board also has responsibilities under the Act to venues, jurisdictions and the Legislature. For example, the Board will consult with representatives of the cities, counties, the waste industry and the venues industry in developing a voluntary model local ordinance for recycling at venues and events. The Board will also develop waste reduction information and resources for venues and events and for local governments.

We will also be updating our jurisdiction annual reporting system and develop model report forms for you.

The Board will also prepare performance reports to the Legislature. For example, in 2008, if the targeted

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

venues and events do not implement their programs, the Board will make recommendations for additional legislation.

--o0o--

MR. SCHMIDLE: Now, those are the very basic requirements. You can find a link to the exact language of the bill, as signed by the Governor, and other helpful information on the Board's "Special Venues" website. And that's W-W-W dot C-I-W-M-B dot C-A dot G-o-v forward slash VENUES.

This website will be the Board's primary information resource for distributing news about implementation of AB 2176. So I'd suggest you take a look at the website and check back frequently over the coming year.

And I would be happy to answer any questions during this question and answer period later today. And I will also be available to you after the meeting. And you can call me or E-mail me at the addresses above. And thank you very much for your time.

And now I think Terry Brennan is going to discuss our resources for composting.

(Thereupon an overhead presentation was Presented as follows.)

MR. BRENNAN: Good afternoon. My name's Terry

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Brennan. I work in the Organic Materials Management Section at the Board. And my primary area of concern is food waste or food waste reduction.

Now that you know about the new laws regarding large venue diversion, we can get down to some of the specifics of dealing with food and some of the resources we have at the Board.

But before I get into that, I want to mention that the Board has adopted a food waste management hierarchy, trying to provide the best end use for surplus food. And that hierarchy is as follows:

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: First, waste prevention. And this is just good business. If you're wasting food, you're wasting something valuable, that you're spending money to purchase. Some of the examples of methods you might use would be just-in-time purchasing for inventory or proper temperature controls. And there are a number of other methods that can be used. So I'm not going to get into right now.

Second would be human consumption. If you have surplus food that's still suitable for human consumption, it should be used for that. That's a better end use than composting or disposal or animal feed options. So you should be working with food banks if you have food that's

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

still considered edible.

Animal feed is also an option. And for large venues, it may seem like a stretch, but there are some fairs that may be able to use some pre-consumer food prep waste. And other examples that this may be possible for. Large pig farms can also, if they're licensed, accept post-consumer food waste.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: Now, all of the resources that I'm about to cover are available on our website. And I'm not going to hand out an example or this whole presentation for that reason. I'm going to briefly cover them here. But you can go to our website and find the stuff at the addresses above. And also there is a handout in the back that has a listing of most everything I'm going to cover here.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: On our website we have a food scrap management site that is organized along the lines of the hierarchy that I mentioned. And within that you can find links to food waste reduction techniques, to food banking information. We have a link to the California Association of Food Banks, that also has a listing of food banks in California. We have information on animal feed auctions and what you might need to do in order to participate in

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

that.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: We have information on food scrap composting. Of course in order to implement a food composting program, you may want to look at your purchasing habits and maybe some of your contracts with food service vendors to make sure that you're having them purchase things that can be composted as well rather than contaminants for the composting stream.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: Also, on that site we have a list of food scrap composting facilities. So you can see if you have one in your area. And this is being updated over time because more and more facilities are coming on line. Right now this is sort of a bottleneck in the state, that some areas, they have a composting facility in the area; others, they don't. It may cost more to transport it that far if it's one that's far away. And of course they have capacity issues too.

But, again, you know, more sites are being composted all the time, or will be.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: We also have information on in-vessel composting technologies if you want to do that on-site yourself. There are some smaller venues, still

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

considered large by the definition in the law. But they may have an opportunity to do some on-site composting themselves.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: And we have a listing there that has photos links to their web pages of the manufacturers and distributors of these types of technologies. And we have everything there from low tech to high tech.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: We also have information on biodegradable products. If you want to buy food serviceware that's biodegradable that's compatible with your composting system, you want to make sure that you work closely with your composter, your material processor to make sure that they can handle the material.

And this is one of those caveat emptor areas where you really want to make sure that what you're purchasing is compostable. Because there are claims made out there that aren't always true for a particular composting system.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: You also want to make sure that you're collecting all your grease and tallow materials and having that diverted as well. There are rendering companies listed on our website that you can contact to

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

have your material collected. This is a big problem in storm drains and sewage plants. The number one cause of beach closure is improper disposal of grease in California. And southern California that's very important.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: You also have a lot of different publications on food waste management. We have case studies based on former WRAP Award winners and other sources. And we have a listing of food scrap publications on our web page that you can get at.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: This is getting added to all the time. As a matter of fact I have few others right now that I'm working on to add to this page. And out of this workshop we might also get some other case studies.

--o0o--

MR. BRENNAN: There's also "Organic Materials Management" website, which goes further into composting of a variety of materials. So if you wanted to learn more just about the composting aspect, you can go there.

But, again, all this information is available on the handout that was on the back table there. All the websites are listed there and more. And so encourage you to take a look at that.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

And if you have any other questions, feel free to contact me.

And now we've got some people here to talk about their own programs. So you can see that it's not just the government telling you to do it. It's possible.

So I'll hand it back over to Chris.

MS. KINSELLA: Thank you, Terry.

Our first panel is representing the San Francisco Giants SBC Park food waste diversion program.

I'd first like to introduce Jack Macy. Jack Macy is the Commercial Recycling Coordinator for the City of San Francisco Department of Environment. Jack has over 18 years experience in composting, recycling and waste management policy and programs at the state and local levels.

Prior to his current position he was San Francisco's Organic Recycling Coordinator, where he initiated and helped develop and implement the nation's first large scale city commercial and residential food composting program, as well as expanded on-site composting edible food recovery and diversion to animal feed.

Jack has facilitated getting San Francisco to establish goals of 75 percent diversion by 2010 and zero waste by 2020. San Francisco achieved a 63-percent diversion rate for 2004.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Jack is working with the SBC Park's food diversion program, which is one of many such programs in the San Francisco area.

Please welcome Jack Macy.

(Thereupon an overhead presentation was Presented as follows.)

PANEL MEMBER MACY: Thank you very much. It's my pleasure to be here to speak to you about food waste diversion at large public venues workshop. And I'm starting off our first panel in talking about San Francisco Giants SBC Food Park waste diversion.

And what I'd like to talk about -- oh, I just got the remote control here. That's cool. I'm going to give a little broader perspective in terms of San Francisco's policy and programs and how that helps support large venue food composting and how it relates to SBC Park. I won't go into too many details with regards to programs of the park, because I've got two experts following me that will go into greater detail.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: So to start off with, I will talk about our policies and goals.

You know, certainly AB 939 has helped driven us to take aggressive actions to increase diversion in San Francisco. And in looking at our waste stream, because we

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

are a dense city with small percentage of yard trimmings, it became clear we needed to go after food waste. So starting back in 1996 we started doing pilot commercial collections with our partner service provider, NorCal Waste Systems and their subsidiaries. And so AB 939 has been a key motivator. And we're waiting for the Board to certify that we've achieved compliance. Our last report for 2002 had us at 63 percent.

But achieving 50 percent is not enough, and we saw that we were going to achieve it. And we wanted to move significantly toward sustainability. And being inspired by the Waste Board adopting zero waste as a strategy, we did too. And we went a little further in terms of sticking some dates to it, an interim date of 75 percent waste diversion by 2010 and zero waste by 2020. Just, you know, not too ambitious. So we'll see how we do that.

But part of our zero waste policy is looking at the highest and best use of materials -- and you heard Terry Brennan talk about a hierarchy, which I will refer to as well -- and also looking at consumer and producer responsibility. Consumers being responsible for the products they buy and for participating in programs, we're looking at mandatory participation -- all our programs are voluntary to date -- and producer responsibility, looking

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

at the kinds of products that are difficult to recycle or compost and trying to encourage or push the marketplace.

And I just came from an interesting meeting with Cargill Dow in that they're pushing their new polylactic acid products that can create clear cups and other compostable plastics that I think provide an opportunity for large venues.

And then we also of course urge the state to go further than what they've done in terms of setting specific goals for zero waste. And we've pleased with the adoption of the bill for large venues. And we think that provides an avenue to provide more assistance to them.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: So in terms of San Francisco, we were looking at what can be done in terms of the hierarchy. There's opportunities to recover edible food. And as I think you'll hear, even at the ballpark there's actually a significant amount of edible food that is recovered through the network of organizations such as the food bank, or we have a group called the Food Runners which collects prepared food and delivers it directly to soup kitchens and meal programs.

And of course I think we can all agree that recovering edible food and feeding it to people is its highest and best use. I know we like to feed it to the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

micro-organisms to create great compost. But if you can feed it to people, that's even better.

Animal feed can be seen as also a high value. And we actually have farmers from Sonoma County that actually pick up certain types of material, like food processing tofu waste or brewery grains that have high protein value, and bringing it up and mixing it into their animal feed, particularly in cattle dairy operations.

Rendering of course is another area. And I think it's really probably the best use for grease and fat is to render it, because it has its problems in composting large volumes. Or maybe to create bio -- which is a new area that we're exploring.

On-site composting is an option that a number of institutions, particularly academic institutions have used. We think it's appropriate. It has its own challenges.

And then of course centralized composting offers the biggest potential for diverting food and other compostable waste. And so that's sort of the focus of -- what I want to talk about is how we've developed our program, what are some of the challenges and strategies that we've invented to give you a bit of a broader context in terms of what's happening? And then we'll focus in on SBC Park.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: So some of the challenges that we've had to deal with, of course: One is to help make sure we have a viable infrastructure for collecting and processing food scraps. In order to produce some marketable compost you need to have good quality product for sustainable programs, and looking at this as a value added, not just simply diverting it.

And then once you -- in the process of creating a program to be able to have financial incentives both for the service providers, such as the hauler, as well as for those who participate in the program. Because there's certainly a perception, if not the reality, that there's an extra effort at least in the beginning in terms of changing operations. So that there needs to be seen as a payback, and preferably more than the feel-good payback of doing the right thing, but an actual cost savings. And that relates of course to management and operational buy-in. Key to get buy-in at management at different levels, but also then just in terms of the operations. And that's where a lot of hand holding, face-to-face contact comes in.

And then subsequently -- or as part of that, addressing the concerns that they may have, or limitations, such as space, which is a real key. If

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

anybody has space constraints, we have it in San Francisco. Concerns around odor or vermin or just the messiness. And then in terms of looking at the streams that we're carrying, particularly at venues and special events, one of the biggest challenges is the large amount of noncompostable food serviceware, the variety of types of packaging from, you know, your polypropylene -- probably polystyrene and polyethylene cups to all sorts of other typically plastic packaging.

And then overall to really be able to create effective participation and have a good quality control so that we can continue to meet the needs of producing valuable products.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: So the basic strategies that we've employed in San Francisco, one is over a process of a period of time in doing pilots and demonstrating it, to really create a program that can serve a wide range of materials, all types of food, not just, say, pre-consumer food prep but all types of pre- and post-consumer meat and then a wide variety of compostable material.

And it's really pretty easy to handle that material at a processing level, a compost facility. And what's great is, you know, things like waxed cardboard can be usually composted. So it really offers an opportunity

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

not just to get food, but the wide associated sort of compostable food serviceware around that. And then to have service that's going to meet the needs, including daily service and a lot of different options.

And Then incentivizing participants with providing discounted rates. So if they are effectively diverting material through composting, that they can actually save money on their garbage bills or concrete savings opportunities. And then for doing the right thing, you know, having recognition through awards. The state does nice awards, we have our own award program, getting good PR. And we were able to give some acknowledgement to the Giants as part of that.

And then the whole program really needs to be something that is of course really easy to understand, convenient. We have our whole color-coded system, using various collection containers and signage, sort of matching internal to external. And as part of that effort -- and this is where we've put most of our investment, particularly with the team here, Applied Compost Consulting -- in working on-site and helping to provide the set up, the training, assistant to address the concerns and needs, and just to make sure that we get the program right in the beginning. The key thing is to get it right. Because if you don't get it right, you end up

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

spending more time.

And as part of that strategy in working with particularly complex institutions is looking at not just doing it all at once, but a phased approach, going after the easier to service areas, kind of behind-the-house food prep. Because obviously, you know, if you're -- the food prep is going to be easier to capture than trying to go into the stands, for example, depending on your strategy. But the potential for contamination sort of increases as you go from behind to the front of the house.

And then having a system to be able to monitor participation and contamination, give immediate feedback and immediate assistance.

And I kind of added a little paren at the last point here, in that looking at addressing the concerns of noncompostable products, we have sort of a new generation of compostable products out there. And we, with our service provider, have agreed to follow really the one scientific standard out there, compostability, which is the Biodegradable Product Institute standard, BPI. And there's now a variety of products, from bags, to cups, to cutleries, that give us an opportunity to substitute noncompostable to compostable.

I'd say the biggest challenge probably is still price. But we're now hearing that with -- for example,

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

with the PLA made from corn, that you can make cup and a variety of things, that that resin now is cost competitive with polyethylene. And if we have a large enough volume uses, we can continue using that.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: So just to illustrate briefly -- I have a few slides just to illustrate the points -- we have this color-coded system, as you can see in green, targeting a range of compostable materials in concert with going after recycled materials. And that allows for a high diversion.

A key thing is having effective educational outreach. We use a lot of graphic images so that you don't have to read, you just see, oh, yeah, all types of food; all types of associated paper, fiber, wood packaging and plants. Multi-languages. Looking at being able to do effective, efficient, clear set-up in the kitchens that's efficient, and looking at recovering now of course not just compostables, but recovering bottles and cans. The more effective you are in recovering bottles and cans, the less likely you're going to have bottle and can contamination in the compost, which is really important.

As the one worst contaminant in compost really is glass, even though plastic is a lot more common, just imagine, once you grind glass in a composting operation,

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

those tiny shards don't screen out too well.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: And then looking at a variety of different types of customized sorting and handling situations. It's really about making this operationally efficient. Because if you don't, it's just not going to sustain itself. So you see here a variety of examples where you've got color-coded systems, green slim-Jim type container for compostables, blue for bottles and cans, gray for trash -- or one over here for plates. You have this example of where you're tipping into a larger container, a bin washing room in the lower right.

Container options in San Francisco range the full gamut, from your reel toters to a variety of larger containers including dedicated compactors and roll-offs, a variety of trucks. And positioning these containers requires, as you can see, efficient placing.

And also the vehicles range from those for side-loading vehicles as well as -- I'll try to go back here, but I don't think I'm able to.

Here we go. Excuse the jumping around.

You know, here we see a front-loading vehicle. That's commonly used for the larger containers. And then we have your side-loading vehicle, which is great for quality control.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: So a key thing is to have a program that offers a diversity of options in terms of containers and service and then on-the-ground direct assistance, because the whole strategy in San Francisco is to collect as clean a source-separated stream so that we keep it clean all the way through to the final quality product.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: I mentioned the compostable food serviceware, bags and others that are an option. And that's something that we've been exploring in San Francisco.

We generally have encouraged participants not to use liners as much as possible, to wash out their bins. We don't want plastic in the final collected material unless it is certified compostable. And that's something that we're seeing more of.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: We have a wide variety of participants in the program, which include many large venues. And I would say that, you know, in terms of large venues, it's not just the SBC Park stadium, although they're the biggest at about 3 million people passing through there a year. But we have other large facilities,

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

including large hotels, such as the St. Francis and the Hilton as you see here, both achieving over 50 percent, which is impressive for a large hotel complex. As well as other venues such as Mosconi Center that has now gone facility-wide with their food collection.

We also have special events, which in a lot of ways are the most challenging arena to do collection of diversion and recycling, particularly composting. But it also provides a particular opportunity if you have a controlled enough environment to do product substitution and have a range of compostable products. And so we've been successful in working with a variety of special events in San Francisco to do that, where we have composting stream.

As you see in the left, it says, "All plates, cups, napkins and utensils in this tent are compostable." Don't usually think of those things that look like and feel like and maybe taste like plastic being compostable. But we now have that opportunity.

And we have events that have achieved 90-percent diversion. The most recent one was the Big Green festival in San Francisco that had tens of thousands of people probably go through it. They achieved an 84-percent diversion rate. So for an event that big I think that's pretty impressive.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: And as I said before, giving recognition, we have a Commercial Recycling of the Year Award Program where we can honor those that achieve the best results. And here we have a shot of the Hilton Hotel receiving the Commercial Recycling of the Year Award.

Unfortunately -- actually I spent some time looking for a shot of us presenting an award to the Giants. I have to admit that that was the most fun award to present, because we got to do an on-field presentation. And if you've been to the SBC Park, as you'll see some more pictures, it's one of the most beautiful ballparks. And to just sort of stand there in the field before a game and present the staff an award for recycling was a lot of fun, and I think it's just a great way to promote the program and help the management see that it really makes sense.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: So to kind of finish up here I want to just give you an idea -- some of you have seen these images -- but what happens to the compostables that get collected. Well, they get transported out to a regional facility near Vacaville. It's the NorCal Jepson Prairie Organics Composting Facility that's taking over 300 tons a day of compostable material from San Francisco

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

as well as additional material from some surrounding communities. And they use the Ag-Bag composting process.

One of the great things about food is that it's high in nitrogen and nutrients, compost fat, it's fast, it speeds up the process.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: And that material, just like a basic composting, it's ground up, it's loaded into these bags where they have forced aeration for 30 to 60 days -- typically using 30 days now. And then with high temperatures of course to kill off all the pathogens of concern. Then it goes through the windrow for 30 days. And then they end up doing screening, three-eighths or a quarter of an inch, creating a nice quality product.

And they do a lot of custom blending for markets. And they've been very effective in marketing, not only to landscaping in golf courses, but into also vineyards and into farms. And what's really great is that they've been able to get their product certified by the Organic Material Review Institute. And so they're really targeting a high value kind of niche market and have been increasing their penetration.

And I heard recently there is a -- sort of a soils guru out there called Amigo Bob who does a lot of consulting to organic farmers, has a radio show. And he's

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

been promoting their four-course compost, as it's called, that NorCal produces. And so they're just getting more requests than they can possibly fill from many organic farms and vineyards.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: And here's an example of a farm, Eatwell.

And what's also nice is that a lot of these farms bring their produce back into San Francisco, selling it at the various farmers markets, or you have a lot of the restaurants that are participating. And hopefully at some point SBC Park will be serving, you know, at least maybe in the luxury suites, organic produce from the farms that are participating or wine.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: So you have basically a nice closing the loop. And I think a real significant thing about food composting wherever it happens is that you really are closing this nutrient loop with high value nutrients that help sustain our local regional soils and economy.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MACY: So for San Francisco we've gotten good results, not only from SBC's participation, which we see as an important model, along with other

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

venues such as the hotels I talked about, Mosconi, the school district, but we have a 150,000 households and nearly a couple thousand businesses on the program and it continues to increase over time. And it's really a program that has a lot of satisfaction, from the management down to the participants, the employees, good benefits, most businesses save, high diversion, and basically closing the loop, as I said. And we see this whole program as an important foundation for us to getting to zero waste. And I think it's a great next step for large public venues to increase their diversion and sustainability.

And I close with that. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. KINSELLA: Thank you, Jack.

I'd like to introduce now Steven Sherman.

Steven Sherman is the President of Applied Compost Consulting, Inc. Steven Sherman's company is based in Oakland. It's established in 1992. Mr. Sherman's organization helps public agencies and private businesses to develop and expand successful recycling, waste reduction and composting programs.

As a member of this panel Steve will speak about the food diversion program that Applied Compost Consulting helped to establish at SBC Park, home of the San Francisco

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Giants, under a contract with the City of San Francisco to provide organics and recycling technical assistance to businesses and institutions.

Please welcome Steven Sherman.

(Thereupon an overhead presentation was Presented as follows.)

PANEL MEMBER SHERMAN: Thank you, Chris.

I'd first like to thank members of the CIWMB who contacted us about participating, especially Chris Kinsella and Cara Morgan and the others.

And the program that we've worked with San Francisco with SBC Park is really a reflection of a series of strong partnerships that we've developed over several years. And a main one is with Jack Macy through the San Francisco Department of the Environment. Applied Compost Consulting works under contract for this project with the Department of the Environment. So our services to SBC Park are at no charge to the Giants.

With the Giants our key partner is Frank Peinado, the Maintenance Manager. He was scheduled to speak today. As a maintenance manager often does, they encounter various emergencies on little notice. He did have a little inkling of it. Hopefully he's patching in remotely today.

The hauler for the Giants has been also

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

instrumental in the success of the program. They've gone above and beyond what is typically done with customers. And I'd like to single Chris Levaggi of Golden Gate Recycling.

He just happened to walk in at the right time.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER SHERMAN: And I'd like to thank also my staff at Applied Compost, who took their extensive previous experience with providing technical assistance to businesses and institutions and brought it to the major league level.

I'd like to go to the next level of drilling down on SBC Park. Let me see if I can get this to work here.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER SHERMAN: I'd like to cover the types of services, and just using the park as a typology of the types of services that are needed with working with -- certainly with large institutions, as we're talking about today. We've also found most of these are types of services that we deal with on a daily basis with institutions and businesses of any size. And that's that we hold usually in concert with the hauler, and sometimes in concert with city staff, initial meetings with managers, because it's key management at the customers that are going to drive the success of the program.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

We then do an initial evaluation of what's possible. We're not there to do detailed waste characterizations. We are there to find out what quick opportunities are there. We seek to build on -- we use the model of rapid small successes tend to build towards bigger, larger successes that take more time but that ultimately are sustainable for the customer.

Applied Compost goes in and provides training to both managers and to staff of all levels, on all shifts, at all times of day and evening, to make sure that they understand the parameters of the program and what their expectations are. And in the process, we're looking for ways to help to -- to help staff to rationalize their own work place, rationalize terms of adding greater efficiency to their own work, which usually means that they're coming up with ideas for ways of making their jobs go better for them.

We do provide a level of follow-up that's required by the complexity of the situation. Some businesses understand just really quickly what to do. Others need quite a bit of follow-up. The level of follow-up is variable. We work within the confines, the parameters of our contract with the city. And we, in concert with the city, the hauler, and the customer, decide as we're going just how much follow-up work is

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

needed or is appropriate. We do use at times a tough love approach of where, if they're not participating well after a certain amount of time, then they're not going to gain the benefits of being involved with the program.

We do provide quite a bit of monitoring to see that they've changed the level of service of -- garbage service and recycling service to what's appropriate. We provide various types of troubleshooting. We report the information to the haulers and to the city. And we're involved with the recognition programs. And we provide strategic planning both for our client, the City of San Francisco, and for the customer, in this case the Giants.

For the Giants currently we're looking at ways to help them to obtain grants for equipment. We do a lot of writing. Their maintenance manager is very focused on day-to-day activities and needs some help. We're trying to see if we can find a way to -- in a short amount of time for us, to gain them some extra benefit. They want to test out some new sorting equipment.

And we're also working with them on how to make pitches to the upper management of the Giants to show the comparative costs, savings and benefits.

And with the city we're working on various forward-looking diversion projects, programs and policies on an ongoing basis.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER SHERMAN: In brief, our objectives are four: With every customer we want to get a high rate of organics recovery; higher rates of existing recycling that we're doing; with low contamination; and that the participation is sustainable.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER SHERMAN: Jack covered many of the positive results already.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER SHERMAN: This is just -- this is not the specific case of SBC Park. But this is, you know, a typical case with a larger customer of where they've got, say, a two-cubic-yard container picked up -- of trash picked up six times a week. And then half of their material after we get involved -- half of it they're diverting to the compost program. They're adding additional recycling on to their preexisting recycling service. And they're able to reduce their trash service quite significantly.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER SHERMAN: Oh, here's a picture of the park. And there is a report on the back table, if you didn't get it, that Christopher Williams and I wrote recently about the progress over the last two years at SBC

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Park. And I'd encourage you to pick that up.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER SHERMAN: Now, here's some key numbers. In 2004 there was an estimate of almost 1800 tons diverted, and with an estimated diversion rate of over 50 percent. Now, in San Francisco that's not meeting the target. And we fully intend to help the Giants to meet the city's 75-percent goal.

The estimated annual trash disposal savings according to the Giants is approximately a hundred thousand dollars a year. And the next figure is not an exact number, but I wanted to give a -- a magnitude number, the cost of our consulting services through the city. Again, to the Giants it hasn't cost anything for our services.

It's roughly about -- it's probably somewhere between a quarter and a third -- I put a third of the -- if you view it as an investment, our costs were a third of what the Giants ended up saving in a year. So if they were paying directly for our services, the payback period would have been less than a year.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER SHERMAN: And we did -- through the National Recycling Coalition's conference recently in San Francisco, We did do a tour -- a couple tours of SBC Park

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

with frank Peinado of the Giants. And if there's sufficient interest by members of the audience to do another one, we would independent of our work with the city -- just did -- in my role today as representing what Frank Peinado had suggested to me, that the Giants would be happy to host a tour, and probably Christopher and I would be involved with helping to facilitate that.

So if you're interested in doing a tour, which might be an hour, hour and a half, come stay for a game, please bring your business card up afterwards or contact either of us after our presentations.

Thanks.

(Applause.)

MS. KINSELLA: Thank you, Steven.

And now I'd like to introduce Christopher Williams, who works as a consultant with Applied Compost Consulting.

Christopher has over 15 years of project and program management experience in municipal solid waste reduction, composting, recycling, and energy conservation.

Under Applied Compost Consulting's commercial recycling technical assistance contract with the City of San Francisco, Christopher has worked closely for the past two years with the San Francisco Giants and its food service contractors at SBC Park.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Christopher is here today to provide some insights into the strategies, challenges, opportunities and results of working at this large venue major league baseball stadium.

Please welcome Christopher Williams.

(Applause.)

(Thereupon an overhead presentation was Presented as follows.)

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: The first thing I wanted to say, given this particular venue, is that it was kind of evocative of, you know, medieval times or something. You've got the moat and the castle wall up here, you know. And so food recycling at large venues is not new. In fact, you know, during the times of tournaments and jousting, there was plenty of food recycling going on. But it was the hurling of expired produce at underperforming actors, you know, and folks like that.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And given what's going on in the NBA these days, I think people still want to hurl the food even though it's now packaged differently.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: But, you know, we just have to get them to hurl it into the right bins.

(Laughter.)

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So that's the main thing.

Mainly what Applied Compost does -- I think Steven covered this really well -- is we helped improve the -- increase the amount of material that's diverted to recycling and composting and improve the stream of that material to make it more marketable, make sure it gets to the highest and best use.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Golden Gate Bridge. A signature shot here, San Francisco. Welcome to San Francisco.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: SBC Park. We're actually looking at a corner of the park where Acme Chop House sits. We actually started our involvement with SBC Park at Acme Chop House. Tom Fox, the executive chef there, contacted NorCal, the city's hauler, and requested food scraps recycling service. And so when we first went out to look at that, you know, we saw this huge problem right away, which is that here's this restaurant that's very motivated to do a good job with -- you know, recycling with large recycling dumpsters that were easily accessible to vendors from the park who would come out and dump all kinds of contaminants into them.

So, you know, we looked up at the park and said,

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

"Boy, that's going to be a big job." And about a year later, Frank Peinado, Maintenance Manager for the park -- in his place I'm speaking today -- contacted NorCal about setting up food scraps recycling.

So we've been involved with them for two seasons now. And, as Jack Macy pointed out to me, the city has calculated our involvement at actually $28,000 a year for two years of involvement with the program. So we're actually quite reasonable -- reasonably priced, I might say.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So I'll leave the marketing part to Steven after that. But you can ask me any technical questions you want after the presentation.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: This is a shot of the park from an area most people that visit the park never get to see, which is the luxury suites. And the reason we started in the luxury suites is because, as Steven pointed out, it's a place where large quantities of foods that are prepared from scratch in adjacent large commercial kitchen facilities are served. Fairly easy to recover those foods, as compared to the stands where a lot of foods are highly packaged in nonrecyclable, certainly noncompostable packaging, which makes it difficult to consolidate it

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

easily and effectively.

Which is not to say there's no cycling going on in the stands. And we'll see some shots of this later in the presentation.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So what we do is we first start with management and get their support for the program, formally introduce the goals and objectives and guidelines for the program. And we get management to introduce us to the staff and say, "This is part of the job description. This is part of what we're doing. Recycling is a key task." And then, "Here are the guys that are going to help you do it."

I cannot tell you how uncomfortable and unproductive it is to get shoved into a kitchen with a bunch of angry people with no time on their hands and sharp-edged, you know, implements and just total strangers saying, "Now you got to start recycling." It just doesn't work. You know, you don't cut their paychecks, so they're not going to listen to you.

So the second thing to do is to really observe and understand what people are doing and who's got what job and how the material is flowing from where it's being generated to the dumpster.

It was really easy for the people that came out

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

and put a garbage bin there the first time. All you had to do was say, "Don't throw it on the floor. Throw it in the bin."

Okay. Our job is a lot harder, which is, "Okay. Now you put these materials and not these other materials in this bin and you put these materials and not these other materials in this bin." So, you know, key things like color coding become extremely important.

But you have to understand how materials are flowing first. And then -- and I used this strategy at the park, a kind of walking-suggestion-box strategy, where being extremely careful not to interfere in people's jobs; and after giving a formal presentation to staff in English and Spanish and, with a little help, to the Chinese-speaking employees, to observe people closely in what they were doing with their jobs and ask for their suggestions about how recycling might be implemented more effectively.

And I found that, you know, if you do it carefully, people are actually very appreciative of the fact that you're soliciting their input. And in fact I've found that a lot of time there's a schism that doesn't really need to exist between staff and management, where staff have a good idea, but management might just reflexively say, "No. You know, we've got it set up the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

way we're going to do it. Everything's working fine. We're not going to do it differently."

And it may in fact be that if we just restructure how the activities are being performed, who's doing what job and how the materials are flowing, we can actually improve the situation for the workers. And that may be hard for you to just believe in words, but it does actually work if it's done correctly.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: This is a shot of a sink in the luxury suites. Let's see, what do you get when you spend thousands of dollars to watch a baseball game? You get hot and cold running water, microwave, flat panel TV, DVD player, live Internet broadband connection, bleachers. And if you pony up a little extra money, tri-tip, baby carrots, you know, in addition to the peanuts and the popcorn and all the other stuff you get in the stands.

In the luxury suites you get to look down on the people that pay slightly less to go see the game that get nachos and stir fry and that kind of stuff. And those people all look down on the folks that buy garlic fries and hot dogs and, you know, like 7-Up. So that's kind of the hierarchy. That's the way that it works.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I'm not making any social

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

statements -- making anybody uncomfortable here, I hope. It's just the reality of how things are.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Mr. IT guy, I'm having a little trouble advancing the slide. You got a suggestion for me?

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: A little bit of a broader -- we're not going to get into that dynamic right now. I'm actually the joke here, as I'm actually the default IT person for my small company. So my boss telling me to push the mouse button, that's really good.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Okay. So as you can see from the counter, you know, the hot dog cooker, the chafing dishes, you know, dead giveaway. But lots of reusable stuff that's easily washed and reused, but also lots of disposable packaging at this level.

We are working with Bon Appetite, the catering contractor, to replace the disposable plastic items with biodegradable plastic items, because those would be really easy to use here.

Another shot of the suites. You can see the plastic to-go container sitting on the chair. Patrons have from two hours before game time till one hour after

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

game time to occupy the suites. And since they've paid for all this, you know, food that they've generated, they're encouraged to take it home. And unfortunately most of it cannot be donated to food rescue agencies because people have touched it and so, you know, it's deemed potentially contaminated.

There is a group called Compadres, which in addition to the food rescue groups mentioned by Jack, actually sponsors catering in specific suites and then takes that prepared food and feeds it to food rescue agencies.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: A little shot of the bleachers right in front of the luxury suites. As you can see, you know, a broad variety of recyclable and nonrecyclable and compostable materials -- food materials.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: So having gathered the information from the staff about what might work best, you know, given full credit to staff for their ideas, recommended new system and new staff roles -- of course this is with full approval of management before representing it to staff -- and allow everybody to share in the success of the program, it really increases the buy-in.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Reinforce the presentation-style recycling training and the walking-suggestion-box training, that I was talking about earlier, with clear and distinctive signage and color-coded bins. Now, a word on the color-coded bins is: You have to be able to see very clearly the distinction between the bins from on top while you're sitting there preparing foods at a rapid rate. It doesn't matter what's on the side of the bin or what color the side of the bin is. You have to be able to look down into the bin and clearly see that it's, you know, the bin that you're after.

Demonstrate consistency with follow-up training and program support. What we've done with NorCal in a lot of cases is we've allowed their drivers to provide cues for us on where contamination is too high. And in some cases, like with SBC Park, we've actually examined loads from the compactor -- garbage compactor on the tipping floor to see, you know, what remains in the recycling that could -- or in the garbage that continue to be recycling.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: On the right hand side is the poster that's available in 11 by 17 and also by 8 1/2 by 11 sizes, laminated and unlaminated, for use in the kitchen and other employee areas. Very clear, graphic. In my humble opinion, an excellently designed promotional

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

piece.

On the left, the sticker on the top of the bin -- we won't go into too much here -- but it's very crowded and doesn't have many graphics and, frankly, is not the kind of thing that most people will stop and read. So kind of good juxtaposed examples of, you know, good sticker/bad sticker.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Here is a kitchen set up. This is not actually SBC Park, but it serves the point about liners. You see that they're using a regular opaque liner in the regular trash container and a biodegradable liner in the organics bin. And the biodegradable liner itself is a color-coding cue. So while this -- the next best -- you know, the best thing -- a better suggestion than this would be not to have a gray organics bin with a sticker on the side, but actually a bright green organics bin. But this at least shows some distinction between the two.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Just an action shot of a porter -- maintenance porter who has to carry the materials from the fourth floor, SBC Park, down a freight elevator, across the park to the loading dock.

Just a quick interesting point: When they

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

designed SBC Park, they forgot to include a garbage storage area. So they're in fact using their loading dock as their garbage storage area. Delivery trucks have to pull out on the -- pull up on the curb out front, which gives Frank a lot of issues to deal with in terms of oil stains on the nice masonry out there and stuff like that.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: But what that does do is at least it gives you the opportunity to dump the material in below grade and bins.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: This is the baler. They bale clean cardboard, and also the cardboard trays. They sweep through the stands and collect the cardboard food trays. Those get marketed separately as a low grade paper.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: This guy's saying, "I have no idea what's in this bowl, but I know where it goes when I'm done with it."

(Laughter.)

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Ray Hernandez, a really great force for composting and recycling at the park. Unfortunately no longer with them. Head chef for Bon

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Appetite Management has been replaced by Dave Buttons there.

Here is a -- early in the program. This is absolutely what you do not want to do with the bins and liners, okay? Zero clue to the worker about what goes in what bin. Absolutely assured of getting maximum contamination in the bin. So this is me telling him, "Ray, can't do it this way, man, you you. You've got to try something different."

And you got to go through this, you know. You've got to go through iterations sometimes in working it out. You'll make suggestions. They'll implement something they think is a great idea and it works terribly. And you go back and you say, "Okay. Well, you know, let's try this other thing."

So a combination of the tough love that Steven talked about before -- which can actually be kind of fun sometimes if it's done right -- and being supportive and realizing that, you know, this is the first experience for these people even though you may have seen it before. So patience, patience, patience.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Which leads me to the normal distribution of staff attitudes. This is not scientific. I'm not a social scientist. But I can tell

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

you that -- this probably resonates with you if you've ever experienced this -- about 10 percent of the people will absolutely not do it, no matter what; about 80 percent of the people will do it as long as there's a system in place and it's, you know, something that they can easily do in and around what else they're doing; and about 10 percent of those folks, just bless them, you know, they will do it no matter what. You know, they'll take it home and recycle it if they have to, you know.

So if you can get the 10 percent and the 80 percent aligned with you, with a program that makes sense, that works, with suggestions about how to set it up, you know, the 10 percent are probably going to be gone in a year because they also happen to have bad performance issues, you know, and don't show up on time, don't play well with others, et cetera, you know. They're just having a hard time and -- you know. So it may be that it's not cost effective or worth it to go after the 10 percent.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: This is going through the stands at the end of the game. They pull beverage containers out of the little holders, the beverage cup holders on the seat backs. Frank told me that he was actually approached at one point by a vendor who wanted to

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

install little plastic bag dispensers on the back of every seat. He just looked at him and said, You just don't get it, do you? We're trying to create less garbage in our park, not more."

So, anyway, they pulled the beverage containers out, sweeped down the -- and beverage containers get captured as they can by a first wave. And I want to point out here that they don't -- they have not increased their maintenance staff at all. As a matter of fact, he was able to cut back his maintenance stuff and slowly add people back in for the recycling and the -- and they still are dealing with less net people than they started with. So he's not experiencing a situation where it's costing him a lot more labor to do this program. Just different organization of staff roles and materials flows as we were talking about before.

So they go through -- they sweep through the stands and collect the materials at the end of every isle --

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: -- separating it at this point into recyclable bottles, nonrecyclable mixed discards, and then the cardboard food service trays.

What Frank would like to do is a combination of working through the contracts with the catering companies,

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Center Plate and Bon Appetite, to change what's being purchased so that it is compostable and compatible with the program. For instance, they are now using the number 2 -- are able to recycle the 2, 4, and 5 plastic cups through NorCal. So they'd like to try to change it over so all of the cups in the stadium are -- you know, number 2, 4, or 5 recyclable.

And then failing that, he's looking at perhaps some kind of sort line to try to take the mixed material and pull valuable components out of it.

Clean mixed cardboard. What was the final count, 10 -- 8 to 12 bales of game -- active game, something like that? Does that sound about right?

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Fairly clean stream of California redemption value containers.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Not so clean stream of organics. Pretty clean percentage-wise. But problem contaminants do creep in there. We see the styrofoam and the plastic and the foil -- which is kind of my pet peeve.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: And then this is just an external shot of the food court area, people not throwing food.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: SBC Park.

Thank you very much.

(Applause.)

MS. KINSELLA: Thank you, gentlemen.

Just a note to our listening audience. I know Steven earlier gave an invitation for a tour of SBC. And since the listening audience can't drop their cards anywhere, they can E-mail us to the same E-mail address, my E-mail -- the same E-mail address that they're E-mailing any questions they may have, which is C-K-I-N-S-E-L-L at C-I-W-M-B dot C-A dot Gov.

Also, some people have been E-mailing in asking about any handouts and presentation. And we will make all the handouts and presentations that you're hearing today available on the Board's website, the same place where we put the Board meeting agendas.

And next I'd like to introduce our next panel. They're representing the Desert Sands Unified School District food waste diversion program.

I'd first like to introduce Rosemary Mindiola, who is the recycling specialist for the Desert Sands Unified School District.

When Rosemary first started working for the Desert Sands Unified School District, she also started

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

attending school board meetings and was very persistent about the district establishing a recycling program.

After testing out the recycling program, Rosemary helped draft a recycling clerk job position, and ended up being the most qualified. She has held the position now for ten years.

Moreover, the position has been completely funded through the waste reduction program savings and managers to send approximately $60,000 annually back to the schools based on their diversion reports.

Rosemary coordinates community service projects for students, staff and teachers. She also monitors the work and expands -- to expand the current recycling program.

She also manages the environmental ambassador grant the district received through our Board and is here to share the results of the food diversion component of that grant.

Please welcome Rosemary Mindiola.

(Applause.)

(Thereupon an overhead presentation was Presented as follows.)

PANEL MEMBER MINDIOLA: All right. First of all I want to talk about how long the recycling program has existed in Desert Sands and just to show that it does pay

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

to recycle and it can be sustained. It's been in existence for ten years. And every year we divert money back to the schools.

The reason the program has stayed successful is because -- children will recycle because it's the right thing to do, but adults want the bottom line. And in a public entity that even more important, because we're always grabbing for dollars. So the first year some of the schools participated. We let them buy in on their own. And those that didn't want to participate, we didn't have them participate.

The following year when those schools saw how much money the other schools got, all the schools were participating. And ever since then they have all been involved in it.

They average anywhere from 3 to $7,000 additional money each year from the district's recycling program, but also they have revenues that come in from toner cartridges and different programs that they do on their site.

Last year we diverted -- I'm going to say the whole number because I'm really proud of it -- 4,242,228 pounds. And the U.S. EPA says that equates to removing 506 passenger cars from the road for one year based on the CO2 emitted annually. So I think that's a pretty good thing to say, especially because in the Coachella Valley

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

we have great blue skies. And to pull off 506 vehicles for a whole year, that's really going to help keep our air clean.

So the next thing is the items that we recycle. And I'm just going to do it real quickly. But that's really important to let you know that it can be done. And it just takes a matter of working with the staff that are involved in doing it.

We do all paper -- all mixed paper, aluminum, glass, plastic, tin, steel Styrofoam. All of our pallets are sold. We bale our own cardboard, but we also divert cardboard to the waste hauler, Waste Management. And all of our fleet vehicle fluids and filters are recycled, toner cartridges. Nextel -- we have a Nextel service. All the phones and batteries are recycled.

Basically, anything that we can recycle, we do. And if we can make money on it, the money goes back to the schools.

This year we passed a new board policy for diversion and conservation. And that was with the help of the Waste Board and Melissa. And -- I want to say your name anyway. So there. And we want to expand it. And it looks like that's a good strong possibility, because the district has now looked at the idea of creating an entire environmental services department. And they've moved me

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

and another employee into this department with a manager. And the focus is going to be to see how far they can expand the recycling in the conservation program.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MINDIOLA: The food diversion program started by the Ambassador Grant.

Desert Sands has actually the two environmental grants: One is a federal grant from the No Child Left Behind. It's a voluntary public school choice. And the focus of those schools, there's six of them and they're in the City of Palm Desert and Indian Wells -- there's one in Indian Wells -- is math, technology, and environmental science. And the magnet is to bring kids from lower-performing schools into those schools, with the focus of eventually graduating with an environmental science diploma and a track that could lead them into an environmental field.

And when I wrote the Ambassador Grant I wanted to coordinate the business with the educational side because it had always been a goal and a dream of mine, because the students are the key and they're the future ambassadors of the world. So if we're not teaching them in the classrooms to make their own environmental decisions, then we're not going to be successful at growing and taking care of the earth, growing a recycling program.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

So out of that came the idea of diverting food. This last year, we started it at the end of the school year. And I'll probably jump around. But at any rate, we started it and we piloted it at three schools.

We had some barriers -- I like to refer to them as challenges -- that we had to deal with. And one of the situations was pricing, because again the school district wants to save money if they make any changes. They don't want to break even or pay more.

The location of the containers for the food -- and it's interesting to think about this because if -- the food is already going into the trash. It's already there. But, yet, suddenly it became a focus of, "Well, it's going to invite rodents and it's going to smell." Well, it's already there anyway. So we had to really help them see that this was probably going to be a better way, because the container would be closed when they're not putting the bags of food in there.

The size and types of containers -- and I'll let Deborah go into that a little bit more, and Frankie. But the situation was how do we fit -- every school as it's being built, they have different enclosures -- and where do we put the roll-offs or do we use bins that are three or four yards and can the truck lift them? So that took a lot of work to set it up. And each school is kind of

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

individualized for their particular needs.

We had to get staff buy-in: The custodians, the teachers, and the administration. The custodians were the easiest actually too. That was not a hard part at all. It was convincing the administration that this wasn't going to be a problem, wasn't going to be a safety issue, the health department wasn't going to be breathing down our necks.

And so they came along with the idea. The teachers, that -- they play a real important role with this, because you can't get it to work if there's not somebody monitoring the kids. And if you have a really good environmental group at the school, then the students can monitor what's going into the containers. Otherwise you'll get contamination, the kids get confused.

At one of the schools we have student ambassadors. They're environmental ambassadors. They have an environmental group. And at that school it's been very successful and the contamination has been very minimum.

And I'll let John -- no, that's not your -- it's our role. Never mind.

The contamination according to John Beerman from Cal Biomass has been extremely low. The students are doing a better job than one of the businesses locally in

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

the valley that does food waste diversion. Kids are not hard to change their minds. They want to do what's right.

Okay. One of the barriers that really frustrated us the most was the biodegradable utensils and the liners. The liners that we've looked at didn't hold up well. And then in the -- the biodegradable ones. An we're in the desert. It's very hot there. So they would break down. We really had to stick with a clear plastic bag. Waste Management provided those for us, and free, which was really nice. And the students would then be able to see that the clear bag was where the food went, and the dark trash bags were where the other items went. So that really helped us get past that.

But the biodegradable utensils were just too expensive. They were almost a hundred times more. What we pay for $13 for a case, they were like $120 a case. So we just couldn't go that route, which is something we really want to do. It just was out of our reach.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MINDIOLA: The incentives is the part that I was -- I'm really happy about this personally. Working for the school district, it's been a lot of fun. I've got a happy personality, so I like happy people.

Frankie is a lot fun. She and Valerie from Waste Management, we work really well together. And all of us

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

were exploring new territory. It was something brand new. It hadn't been done in our valley with any of the schools. And for us there was a lot riding on it succeeding. So that there weren't any problems and the school district would just say, "No, we're not doing it. It's not going to happen here."

We piloted for about five weeks -- four weeks or so at the end of last year. And I just want to emphasize it was only four weeks at three elementary schools. And in that four-weeks' time there was 2.31 tons diverted. And according to John, there was very minimal contamination. The kids did really, really well.

The incentive that the school district is providing for the school sites is separate from what happens with the big pool of money. Their tonnage reports is how they get paid each year out of that rebate. But the schools that are doing the food waste diversion, the money saved at their site is solely their money. So that was an added incentive for them to get involved in it.

I want to say that Waste Management and Cal Biomass piloted the four weeks for free, which was really helpful to us because, like I said, the school district is looking, "What is it going to cost us? Is it going to cost more?" And because they piloted it, people were more openminded about giving it a try. And it really went

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

really well.

We started up in September. The problem that we run into is construction. We have a lot of remodeling going on down in the desert. And the growth is about 3 percent annually. So we have 14 schools planned in the next ten years. We're just now building two. The schools that piloted the program, one is under remodel, the other one is currently going to move into a temporary sight and that's school's being demo'd. So as soon as they move in in a week from now they're going to start back with the composting. But they just felt it would be just too difficult to try and start it and then move everything to the new site. So they're going start out with a new site.

But two of the schools are still currently doing it. One is doing very well. And I want to emphasize the reason why is the students' monitoring what's going in the bins and the teacher support at that school.

One is not going so well because they don't have an environmental club. And we need to really work on that with the school.

It took about two weeks to get it up and running smooth at the school sites. But it does take constant spot checks to make sure that they're doing okay, make sure that the container is constantly closed so that no children can get into it, because kids do things like

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

that. And also to make sure that the contamination level is down low or not at all.

The Cal Biomass actually charges us 1950 versus 3450 at the landfill. Their facility is half the distant as the landfill was. So there's quite a substantial savings in that area.

Waste Management gave us a 10-percent reduction to make sure that the program's successful and that we can keep doing it so that our school district would say, "Okay, we're saving money, so we can continue doing this."

I think that's all I wanted to cover in that particular area.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER MINDIOLA: And I think it's your turn, Frankie.

MS. KINSELLA: Rosemary, let me introduce Frankie.

PANEL MEMBER MINDIOLA: Wait, there is one more item. That's right.

Waste Management challenged the schools that are doing the composting -- the diversion and offered $2,000 to the school that can achieve zero waste. And I thought that was pretty awesome that a waste hauler that is complying with the cities and working very hard, that they threw down the gauntlet to the schools and said, "If you

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

can get to zero waste, we will pay you $2,000. So that's an added incentive.

And I just want to say -- I'm going to kind of wrap it up in the closing. What has worked so well is that none of us had ever done this before, but working together, all three of us, we were able to transition into it and have really no major problems at all, not even really minor problems. And that's really key. So the school districts that are considering doing it, you really have to work with your cities and you really need to work with whoever your waste hauler is. And see if you can get the group together so that you can plan it out well and not have any problems come up to begin with.

MS. KINSELLA: I'm sorry.

(Applause.)

MS. KINSELLA: I was going to introduce all three ladies at the same time, and I didn't do that.

I'd like to introduce Frankie Riddle now. She's with the City of Palm Desert, Recycling -- she's the City of Palm Desert Recycling Coordinator.

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: Valerie is next.

MS. KINSELLA: Valerie's next?

Oh, I'm sorry.

Okay. Valerie's next.

Valerie Ward is a recycling coordinator for Waste

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Management of the Desert. She's been with Waste Management of the Desert for four years as a recycling coordinator, and works with cities -- local cities, schools, businesses, and residents to educate and increase environmental awareness.

Valerie also creates and implements recycling programs throughout the Coachella Valley and has worked diligently with Desert Sands School District and the cities in the district to start up and manage their food waste recycling program.

Please welcome Valerie Ward.

(Applause.)

(Thereupon an overhead presentation was Presented as follows.)

PANEL MEMBER WARD: First I want to apologize for my voice. And if I start a coughing fit, Rosemary's going to take over for me.

My role actually -- is that better?

My role -- one of my roles was doing most of the training and monitoring of the food waste programs at the schools. And I would start out with assemblies of the kids. And I would go through and I would show them -- I first I would show them a video. And the video is called Kids Talking Trash. And it talks about the 4 R's, the reducing, reuse, recycle, and rot. And then it goes into

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

the food composting.

And then I would take apart a complete lunch, because their lunches come in this cardboard box and it comes with plastic and card -- lot's of paper and things. And I would take apart this whole lunch and put it into the separate bins and show them exactly where everything goes. The plastics will go in the trash. The food waste will go into the recycle bin. And the recycle one had a clear bag; the trash had a black bag. And they would really -- when I dumped out the pizza -- we had a lunch once and we dumped the pizza out. And the kids just were appalled because I dumped that pizza in the recycle bin. But it's really good to see that hands-on.

And the color coding, we color coded the containers to the tables. And we used construction paper. We would have like a red station and a yellow station, a green station, a blue station. And we would have four stations, and they were color coded to the tables. And the kids that are sitting at the red table will go to the red station. And that's where they would deposit their recyclables and their trash.

And at each station -- Rosemary had mentioned the environmental club. These are a group of kids that were at the school that were the recycle monitors -- we called them the recycle monitors. And there were two per

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

station. And these kids would monitor and stand there and show the kids where to put which -- either the trash or the reclyclables.

The problem we were having -- that we do have with that is that the kids want to -- they're so helpful that they want to help the other kids, and they'll take their stuff off their trays and they'll put it there for them. But we don't want them to do that. We want them to show the kids how to do it so they could do it themselves, so they're not always going up there saying, "Here, you go head and do it for me."

So that's just an issue with kids. Kids just like helping. But we just have to explain to them that that's -- they can't be taking the food from the kids or other things off their trays.

We also use posters with pictures of the recyclable items on the containers that we use. We put it right on the containers so the kids can walk up and they can see, "Oh, this is where my food goes, this is where my milk carton goes, this is where my straw goes or my plastics or juice boxes."

And let's see.

Okay. Next please.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WARD: One of the other -- these are

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

some of the kids at one of the recycle stations. There's a couple of the Board members there actually also.

This was just on one of the days -- this was the kick off we had. And you see the colored bags, the trash bags. We started off with two trash and one recycle container because we weren't sure how much -- we kind of tried to do two containers so -- or one on each side so their kids would come up from two different ways. But that didn't work. And so we had to just -- we ended up going down to just two containers, one recycle and one trash, because the recycle container fills up much faster than the trash does.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WARD: And then one of the other issues, we didn't have enough monitors at some of the schools. We don't have a lot of -- we don't have an environmental club at each school. Some schools have science classes. But the teachers are hesitant to let the kids out of class to go ahead and do this. They don't want them to miss any education time, which is understandable. But this is an issue that we're -- it's a challenge that we're working through and that we're trying to get the teachers more buy-in with this and just some more additional ideas. And I'm going to -- And I also talk with the staff. I have staff training too, because

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

staff is key. Staff is actually first. I train the staff first and then the students.

One of the -- the biggest challenge with Waste Management as Waste Management, the hauler, is putting together a program that's cost effective. The roll-off -- the rolls-offs work really well. But trying to do a commercial -- commercial bins, it's just not a cost -- it's just not cost effective for Waste Management. You have a -- you know, five or ten stops with a $250,000 truck, and when that truck will normally -- for the food waste for commercial bin, when that truck would normally pick up between 100 and 250 containers in that day. So it's just not a cost effective situation for those containers.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER WARD: And another difficult -- or a challenge is finding room for roll-off at the schools. So we have to look at other ways. So we're still in the process of working through all of our challenges.

Incentives for us. We are helping the jurisdictions meet their diversion rates, which is -- everybody knows that that's -- it's a big thing these days, and partnerships -- building partnerships within the community. And I couldn't ask for better partners to work with than these two gals right here.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Now, they're great people to work with. And this program has done quite well, I believe.

I think that's about it. For me it is.

(Applause.)

MS. KINSELLA: Thank you, Valerie.

Now I get to introduce Frankie.

Frankie is the City of Palm Desert Recycling Coordinator. She's worked for the city for 20 years, and as a recycling coordinator for the past five years.

Frankie is currently developing recycling education and awareness campaigns as well as construction and demolition ordinance programs for the city's contractors.

When the Desert Sands Unified School District received an Environmental Ambassador Grant from the Waste Board, Frankie and the City of Palm Desert were there to support the school facility waste reduction programs, which included starting up a cafeteria food waste diversion program.

Please welcome Frankie.

(Applause.)

(Thereupon an overhead presentation was Presented as follows.)

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: Good afternoon.

I'd like to start by reiterating what Rosemary

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

said, that any program that you start, it's very vital to have a good team working together. And the reason why the city was originally invited to participate was primarily because we had been doing things at the schools already. Because as a jurisdiction, we want to be involved in the community, and a big part of the community are the schools.

Some of the programs that we started with and which made it a natural fit for us to participate in the program after being invited by the school district was we had already been doing Earth Day, Arbor Day. We even donated some of our Department of Conservation funds for various programs, such as the high school. They redid their quad area and they relandscaped it. And part of what they wanted to do was to put in some new recycling containers.

So with the money they bought recycling containers. They put their little logo on it for the Aztecs and everything. They thought that was great that we participated and donated the money for the containers.

We've also donated money to the local college for other similar recycling programs.

So it was basically a natural fit and we were glad to participate.

--o0o--

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: What is the city's role? The city's role in the Ambassador Program and basically being part of any program with the school or in the community is to assist as being a partner. And in this particular instance a partner between the Desert Sands Unified School District; the waste hauler, Waste Management; and other jurisdictions.

By bringing the group together, it just made -- you get more input, you put together a better overall plan, and it expands out more into other communities. And I think that was one of the great benefits of having the different partners, is that it did expand out more into the community and I think even other jurisdictions. Like La Quinta is considering participating now.

Because when they see something good happening in one area, then, you know, other people want to participate. And I think that's a great thing.

We provided hands-on assistance from program development to implementation. We even helped train some of the staff and students when Valerie, you know, couldn't make it. We all pitched in and we did what we needed to do to make the program successful and work.

We provided other types of assistance such as funds to purchase containers. And I already mentioned that. Just whatever we needed to do to make the program

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

work, that's what we did.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: Why was is important for the city to get involved?

To me, to demonstrate by action -- not just by words, but by action the city's commitment to a school, kids, and parents, which has a jurisdiction that equals our residents and, you know, constituents, which we all care about what they think.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: Again, to demonstrate by action the city's commitment to the environment and programs that pave the way for future environmental programs, and to expand awareness and participation in such programs.

Palm Desert has always been very interested in the environment. We have a drought-tolerant landscaping in all of our medians. We have -- I don't even -- we have so many recycling -- we're working on a new C&D ordinance. We've been instrumental in putting that together with C-BAG as well as some of the other jurisdictions. But where it comes to environmental issues, we definitely are the first to take the initiative.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: What were some of the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

barriers?

Since there is no economy of scale in our area, special arrangements had to be made between Desert Sands, Waste Management, and California Biomass for the hauling and composting of the food waste.

You know, we don't have a lot of large venues in the area that participate in the food waste, such as the hotels. We have one hotel, which is a lodge and it's in Rancho Mirage. They do a great food waste program. But that's really the only -- mine says check video.

My screen's blank.

MS. KINSELLA: Can you look behind you, Frankie?

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: Huh?

MS. KINSELLA: Can you turn around and look behind you?

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: As long as I find mine though, I'll be okay.

I've got mine right here.

Restaurants and other food-generating businesses basically are participating. The more participation, the more economically feasible the program becomes. And basically that's the overall goal. Like Valerie said, for them, if it's not economically feasible, it's really -- you know, they're not going to be able to provide the service. So by doing these programs with the schools, it

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

increases the participation. Then hopefully we will be able to expand that out into the community, such as our hotels, restaurants. We have a lot of clubhouses at golf courses that, you know, they have special events and they serve food and stuff. And those are the kind of places that he want to hopefully bring on board eventually to expand the food waste program.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: How was the hauling of food waste arranged and how was the hauler selected?

Special arrangements again had to be made with California Biomass, a local composting facility, to accept the food waste. And I don't think at that particular time we had a facility in the area, did we, John, that provided for food waste or composting?

PANEL MEMBER BEERMAN: No, we just were permitted to do that the last couple years.

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: Right, to do that.

So that was another issue. We had to, you know, work to get a facility to actually accept the food waste. There are only three haulers in the Coachella Valley, Waste Management being the primary hauler. We have Palm Springs Disposal and Desert Valley Disposal. And the school district was actually already utilizing waste management. So it was basically just natural for them to

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

partner up with Waste Management to help put in the program and put it into effect.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: Aside from adding the City's diversion waste, what were some of the other benefits to the City?

Improved community awareness, like I said, from kids to parents, school staff, which again goes out into the community. The more kids know, the more they take to their parents, the more their parents know as adults, the more they -- you know, it just is an effect that just, you know, continues on.

Increased participation in all aspects of recycling, whether a person is at school, at home or even in the public. Recycling is an opportunity. Opportunities are everywhere. They're not just in the home. They can be when you're out doing something. Instead of throwing something in the trash, you can throw it in the recycling bin. And, you know, when we promote that kind of stuff, it increases awareness and more participation. And I think that's what we all need to do, is not just think about recycling when we're at home, but when we're out and about as well.

Create a positive image for recycling and those that participate. That's a big one. Because not everyone

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

thinks that recycling is important. And, you know, to change people's perspective is what we'd need to do. And I think we're slowly getting there.

The knowledge that the city is actively participating in development of programs designed to improve the community and the environment simultaneously is very important. And I think for a jurisdiction again, those are all the things that matter to us and what we look for. Because I think it's our responsibility to our constituents that we look for programs like that and we do actively pursue programs that help the environment.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: Why should we continue with the program?

Basically in the hope that the program will expand, like a said, out into the community to local hotels and restaurants.

Anticipating the educational benefit that youth as well as adults will gain from the program and be carried throughout their lifetime. I don't think once someone basically starts to recycle and they change their belief that it is important that they'll stop. I think it's something that will always continue on.

Continuing to cooperate with agencies to address any issue that impacts the community as a whole is another

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

thing that as a jurisdiction we look for. I think once you start working with other agencies, it doesn't stop there. It continues on into other areas.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: So basically, the city continues to look forward to working with Desert Sands as well as other organizations to improve the food waste program and other recycling programs that schools will develop in the future. And that's what we're looking forward to.

And thank you.

(Applause.)

PANEL MEMBER MINDIOLA: Before you go on to the next person, I did have something to add to the end of it.

I wanted to say that California Biomass has done something beyond just taking the end product. They are bringing the diverted food waste after it's composted back to the schools.

All of the Palm Desert schools are -- most of them already have their gardens in place. But they're putting greenhouses into the schools. And he is supplying -- John Beerman's company, they are supplying the compost from the schools back to the schools for their garden projects. They are doing hydroponics at the middle school, and they're propagating indigenous plants; which

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

the city is working with the local builders to purchase those to help sustain their gardening program after the grants go away.

They are also going to put the compost on the field but not the entire field, so the students can observe the effects on the landscape with compost and without compost.

Our ultimate goal is to expand this across the entire district, first at all the elementary but one middle school, which is the environmental science school, and then eventually move it into the high schools. Because we know that -- because the kids are transitional, they're moving up in grades, they're going to take these attitudes with them and want to continue doing it when they are in high school. So ultimately we want to be doing this at all 28 sites.

(Applause.)

MS. KINSELLA: Thank you. Nice program.

We're going to take a 10-minute break here. And I know -- is Leslie Lukacs in the audience?

Leslie wanted to say a few words about her organization for large venues.

MS. LUKACS: Hello. My name's Leslie Lukacs and I represent the Venues and Special Events Recycling Council. It's a council which is part of the California

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Resource Recovery Association.

And I just wanted to let everybody, and the audience knows, that this council is around, and we work as more of a peer-to-peer organization. We have probably about 200 people who are signed up -- people who are interested in venues or work with venues or are venue operators. So it's just a way to share case studies, share information, find out who's doing what.

And so if you wanted to get into the Venues Council, I'll put a sign-up sheet in the back of the room and you can just sign up your name throughout the day. And I'll get you into getting more information about the Venues Council.

Thank you.

(Thereupon a recess was taken.)

MS. KINSELLA: Okay. We're going to get started again. We're running about, oh, 10, 15 minutes behind. And I apologize to our listening audience.

If the speakers will take their seats.

We are first going to look at a video on the Indian Wells Food Scrap Diversion Program that is on the Board's website. So our listeners if they want to watch the video as well, the website is WWW.CIWMB.CA.GOV/VIDEO/ARCHIVE.HTM. And then they would need to scroll down to "food scrap recycling".

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

First let me introduce William O'Toole.

William O'Toole is the owner of EcoNomics, Inc. William O'Toole has worked in private industry and public sector -- I'm sorry -- has worked for private industry and public sector clients expanding and implementing recycling programs for over 25 years.

William founded EcoNomics, Inc., in 1977, which specializes in providing strategic planning and analysis for corporate clients and for public sector agencies.

During the food diversion contract with the City of Indian Wells, William, as the city's consultant, was on site at the Tennis Gardens and very visible before, during and after the event and provided on-site technical assistance.

Please welcome William O'Toole.

(Applause.)

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: So are you going to start with the video?

MS. KINSELLA: I'm sorry. We're going to show the video now.

(Thereupon a video was played.)

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: You can tell from the credits that is an older picture.

(Thereupon an overhead presentation was Presented as follows.)

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: While the PowerPoint comes up I'd like to do a few acknowledgments. There's been mentioned earlier that I'm -- I did not do this single-handedly. There was a lot of folks that really, really helped a great deal.

The city itself, the City of Indian Wells, there was five council people that all decided that this was a good idea: Mary Roche, Ed Monarch, Percy Bird, Conrad Negron, and a Rob Bernheimer. They all got behind this. And the reason that was important, you'll see, I'm going to talk about sponsorships later and how that relates to sports events.

But the city entered in the sponsorship relationship with the Tennis Garden. And then they made the food waste program a part of that whole project. So that was an enormous backing, and it gave a real strong footing for us to be able to go in and do what we did to develop the program.

Then the city staff -- Gary Calhoun couldn't be here today. He's much in demand. He also -- he's an ex-Marine and he's about 6 foot 3, and we needed that at 2 o'clock in the morning when we're getting the program to work. There were some days where we went 20 hours, slept for 4 and came back to make it happen.

So on the city political side as well as on the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

staff side there was a tremendous amount of support. And that was really what made this project viable; along with some money that the state gave, which was also critical at the right point to push it over the top.

So let's see if I can get my left click here.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: I went to just a few of the nitty-gritty questions: How much food was diverted? How well did we do?

And to answer that there's three different areas:

The kitchen, which was what you saw in the film is the area where we went after first. And that was the area that had the most accessible and the most volume amount of food. And we did get to our goal of 90 percent diverted out of the kitchen area.

The suites is more complicated in that you have what we've labeled the aesthetic challenge or the aesthetic barrier, which is you have -- people are coming in. They go to the suite. They are paying, as the prior presenter had said, a large sum of money to watch a game. And they want to have an experience that is commensurate with the amount of money they spent. So you're not going to go in and go too strongly -- you're not going to step in there and go, "Oh, sorry. You have to put the food over here." They may or may not respond well to that kind

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

of...

So what we did is again we went back to the tennis management staff and developed a method that we could get the food out of the suites further downstream. After it got taken out of the suites there was three assembling areas. And we were then able to get more diversion happen at those three sub-assembly areas. And then that flow went down into the kitchen and it flowed into the kitchen.

So as a percentage, I'd say 60 percent of the food waste coming out of the suites is recovered.

The final place that we had was the food courts. And the food court is the equivalent of what was identified as the nachos area. Except this is tennis, so it's cob salads.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: And the cob salad crowd -- that was the woman -- and they get the Ben & Jerry's Ice Cream and so forth. And you saw the woman taking her Ben & Jerry's container and dropping it into the beverage-container-only box. And that has proven to be the most challenging. We've tried three different sets of signage, and short of having a little electronic device that would say, "Please put your device" -- as your hand triggered by motion, which I think there's a market for

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

that.

But we really have gotten to the point in the food court that we split that one further. And we went to the kitchen prep areas in each one of the food court tents. And we've been able to give about 70 percent of the material out of there.

And then finally I would say we're getting less than a quarter of the post-consumer waste coming out of the food court, despite massive attempts and efforts.

Now, I'm going to talk about -- I'm going to swing back on to the food court and how I think we can get that number from 25 back up into the 70 to 90 percent, and that's with biodegradable plastics. But I'll finish up the talk with that.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: The total amount of food that we got out for the ten-day event was 10.58 tons.

John Beerman on the left here is from Cal Biomass. He has worked also extensively and showed up a couple times at odd hours of the morning and evening to help us with contamination issues. And he can go into more detail of how we finally got to where we needed to go in getting all the wine bottles out. That was the big issue, wine bottles. No glass.

--o0o--

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: How do you go back? Right click.

I use a MacIntosh. And it's obvious I'm computer illiterate.

So how long did it take us to get the program where we want it to be?

It was very gradually introduced. I'm going to use the phrase that I heard earlier, which is a great one, rapid small successes lead to larger, longer-term big successes.

We went in -- as the first point we just went in for containers. That's all we wanted, was aluminum cans and the bottles. Then the stadium management decided that we were not too strange and we didn't disrupt their life too much, and we said, "How about cardboard?" And you have to understand -- you'd have to see a picture of what you were looking at with all those people, and all those people are 200,000 plus over 10 days, is before -- it's like a circus. You have the stadium that exists, but you have all that tent area that's around on five acres. Along with it's retail and food. And that all literally goes up like a circus with tents.

So in the midst of all the tents going up, you also have to get cardboard bins placed; and then you have to talk to people that are just coming in, setting up

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

their tent and their retailer outlets, to put the cardboard in the right place.

We got, again, tremendous support from the Tennis Gardens. There's a guy named Bill Clark, who's the operations manager. And he has these little radios -- he has about actually six radios that dangle off him during the event. And the big communication issue -- and they gave us all our little radios, so we're part of that group. But if Bill says -- he comes on and he says, "Clark break," what that is your equivalent of, everybody stop exactly what you're doing. And he actually did that. And that's a big deal, really big deal, because it's like an emergency, "Clark break." And he said, "Everybody, I want the cardboard to go to the right place. Bill out."

From that point on, the program worked wonderfully. And it's the key issue of get the key management in place. If they support you, it will really, really work. If they don't, you've got problems from the get-go and it just sort of snowballs all the way through. Obviously it didn't always go well, or else I wouldn't be able to say that.

We went to the foot scraps late in 2000, and we just did a few events at the stadium. They have those one-day or two-day events, and we tried to just get an idea of would it work, could we get the container from

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Waste Management, could we get the right container? We finally got that one. It was a 10 yarder; it worked out perfectly.

And we also worked with Cal Biomass. And John looks at me again and said, "What are you bringing me this time?" And eventually he was happy with what I brought him.

We expanded into the suites and the food court in 2001. And then we introduced biodegradable plastics in 2004.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: Click.

Okay. There was a lot of challenges and there were a lot of solutions. I focused on just four that I thought were -- if you can get these down, you can probably work through the rest.

The first one is you're going into a stadium operation and there's a tremendous amount of money and gambling. These people just hope that a lot of people show up. And they have fixed costs on one side, as the players cost a great deal and the venue costs a great deal. And they're just really hoping that people buy tickets.

And it's sort of like throwing a party and you bought enough food for 50 people, and now it's two hours

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

before the party begins. Is anybody going to show up.

That creates a lot of tension in the management. Consequently, the people that gravitate towards stadium venue management are pretty prone to be high pressure and people that thrive in high adrenalin situations. You've got to fit into that mode. If you don't, you're dead. You have to never forget that they are in a high adrenalin and a real intense operation. And you are at first viewed as you're going to disrupt their activity. And they're already operating at 120 percent. And they just see you as the extra little that's going to cause the whole house of cards to trash on them.

So what I did is -- it was like a stop card on a train, like in Polar Express, the movie that the little kid pulls a thing and it stops the train. I gave them the power -- and we did it two or three times before they finally trusted me -- where they could just say, "Stop. Go away." And we would just pull people out, and it would just go back to doing trash. And then we'd fixed whatever happened. And then -- it usually took an hour or two or three, sometimes a day, and then we'd say, "Okay. We got it fixed. Can we go again?" And they would.

Once they had the feeling that we would stop and get out of their way at any time they told us to, they stopped even asking us to get out of their way. In fact,

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

then they started helping. But they needed the support from our side that we understood their situation and we were not going to disrupt their stadium management.

That was very, very critical.

Second one, you heard it from the Giants -- or not Giants -- yeah, Giants stadium, SBC Park. Did anybody see a film named Roller Ball where they had all the corporations name the parks?

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: You have to fit into their program. And I would heartily endorse what you heard earlier. The people that are already doing the job have got these great ideas on how to make the job work easier. And then you come in and you tell them that you want to do recycling and here's the work flow.

And the individual that made the kitchen work was the head chef, the executive chef. His name was Paul Taylor. And he works for Restaurant Management Associates. And he came up with the ideal way to place the container, which actually was a bus tub, in the center of the prep table to put the scraps into.

And once he did that, the work flow cleaned up beautifully and everything happened, contamination went away and our recovery weight went up by about 40 percent. And it was really the chef's idea.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

That was also rapport. We had established rapport, and he actually started to want to have the program work. And then he put some attention to it, and it really was very, very helpful.

So that's operations, work flow, and communications.

And the first thing I always asked was, "Can I just stand and watch?" And they literally give you a little spot. Because being in a kitchen is like trying to cross the Los Angeles 405 at five o'clock, is there are literally people running with lots of food, some cooked, some uncooked, some prep. And you will literally get run over or food will go flying. So they put a little spot, and it's usually up against the walk-in refrigerator, and they say, Stand here." And you stand there and you make your notes.

And then afterwards when it's all done -- and they will give you a time. Ask the chef or ask the head porter, "What time would you like to meet?" And no matter what time they say, do it. And it isn't going to be convenient, most likely, because they start at 4:30 in the morning and they go to 11:30 at night. So usually you get to meet them at 4 in the morning or 3:30 in the morning, before everything starts.

Once you do that a couple times, you're part of

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

the team again and they start helping you.

Training and impacts on staffing. It's a little redundant from what you heard earlier. But again if the job tasks and duties get integrated into what you need to do for your diversion and you listen to the ideas, you will find that you don't increase staffing requirements. Because you're not moving more material. It's the same amount of material. You're just moving it, and you just want to split a stream somewhere, from food and recyclables and trash. And you find the point where that stream can get split most easily. And each -- that is a custom job. For each venue, that's going to be different.

And then finally you've got a coordination of all the different vendors. If you think about it, you've got the housekeeping/porters, you have catering, you have food preparation.

At the bottom of this you all see where it says, "Meet with all line management." And that includes security.

Security is a funny story. We didn't include security because we thought, "Well, you know, what's security really got to do with a food recycling program?" Until we didn't have the right badge to get in the right place where we needed to to troubleshoot the program. And we lost half a day while we went back in the middle of the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

event and got our badges changed to the right badge so that we had all access. And of course they won't give you an all-access pass unless they trust you. So you've got a little bit of a chicken-egg thing. You may have start to start out with a less-than-everywhere pass and then build your way up to it.

And, again, you're going to have a situation, probably more in this type of a venue -- it's a 16,000 seat stadium -- where you've got a lot of famous people, tennis players and so forth, and you just have to melt in. Your program has to be invisible. And you can't, you know, gasp and go, "Isn't that... Gosh, I wish I could get their autograph." You just have to flow with it. Just be part of the venue and don't bother anything or anyone and get your job done and stay out of the way. Got that attitude, things work great.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: Training. Again, it goes back to make sure you cover all the bases. And the way you're going to have to do that is spend a day or so following the trash around. I don't know if anybody remembers the movie Wall Street where he found out when the one company was going to buy by going through the trash. You just kind of do the same thing. You'll follow the trash around and through the event. People wonder

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

what you're doing with a clipboard following a trash can. And keep your clipboard, because otherwise people don't know what you're doing.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: And they ask. And then they escort you out.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: Then this is -- I would say the secret of venue recycling is this one. And I was talking earlier to other folks from SBC stadium. What we always do is we poach the two or three best porters that we can find. We watch for a day and a half, and then we go back to management and say, "Can we assign these folks to our recycling?" And we have T-shirts, caps, and whole thing. And they critically change the program. Every time we've done this it works. We dropped -- I got no more calls from John Beerman about contamination when I identified this one guy.

And everything had to be color coded because he spoke a dialect of Spanish and English and indian, Oshoka. And I didn't speak any of those very well, not even English. And he though was one of the most phenomenal workers that I've ever run across. And we put him in charge. And after that there was no more glass contamination.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

Then there was another thing. There was a guy that was about 20 years old. He was doing this as a job and he was going off to college and graduate school in Germany. But he was really pro recycling, and he loved recycling. And he got rid of all the glass contamination in the other half of the venue.

Those two people made the program a success.

And that's not an overstatement. Really, all the thousands of dollars planning and all the meetings and all the rest of it, it comes down to those two people, those couple of pairs of hands that's either going to get it in the right place or the wrong place.

And what we finally came down to was is we would station people at the roll-offs where either the food or the cardboard or the beverage containers went. And it was their job -- they were the traffic cop. And if they had any doubts as to whether it should or shouldn't go into the bin, we always told them err on the side of put it in the trash. And after that I didn't get any calls from John Beerman. And it was great. And John was happy with me and we were happy.

Then what's last is monitor, retrain, monitor, retain, and monitor and retrain, which just means, "Don't go away."

It's very much -- there was the guy that does

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

plates on the end of a stick, and there's like 20 of them. And when he gets to the one plate, it starts to fall off and he has to run down to the other stick and spin the next one to keep them all. That's pretty much what your life is. Tell your wife, kids, dog, children that you're going to disappear for a certain amount of time, and then this is what you're going to do.

And once you do that for a while in a stadium environment, it will get institutionalized. Ours is more like a circus event that lasts two weeks. And special events are more of this nature, where you really have to stay on them more, because you have different people circulating in and you're going to have people come in and then go out. They work for five or six days and then they disappear, and then somebody else comes in and you have to retrain them.

And then the funny one is, we had a program going two years ago and we thought everything is really fantastic. And all of a sudden, in the morning we would go to the bins and Gary Calhoun would tell me how he had spent an hour getting glass out of a bin. And we're trying to figure out what went wrong. What happened is the shift -- they added a third shift that went from 11 o'clock to 7 -- 11 o'clock at night to 7 o'clock in the morning. And we didn't know they added the shift, and

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

nobody had trained the six people that they had hired to put on that shift, which they had hired at something like 11 o'clock at night. So we found out the next day. And then, yes, we got to show up at 1:30 in the morning to work with these folks until they got trained, and then contamination level went down.

We have a chart in our report. And our food diversion that year went down by 50 percent. Just missing that one shift took the program and dropped it from about nine tons of recovery down to four tons of recovery. And I got a lot of calls that year from John. He'll talk about that more.

So you have to stay on an retrain it.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: This is an abbreviated costs slide. This is what the tennis venue sees:

Is that it had another $780 in labor cost for the folks that were standing by the bins. We think this year we've got that blended in to all the rates. But I won't know until the end of March this year.

The reduction in the hauling and the tip fee was about 13,800.

So as far as the Tennis Garden is concerned, they saw a drop of about 13,000.

Now, there's the grant money that the state put

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

in and there's the staff time from the city side and my time that the city has covered. The other thing that was put in is that the city would get the DOC grant money and we would buy containers, which you saw in the video. And we rotate them around special events. The tennis event is one thing. They also go on to different golf courses for other events.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: Chris Kinsella, who has been very patient as I tried to get final reports to her, asked and put out some bullets to us to help guide us along here. And one of the questions was: "What could you incentivize the venue? And do you think you could regulate?" And I'll go on the record here as, I vote for carrots. And what they get -- what the venue definitely will get is a tighter control of their disposal costs and they'll actually know what's happening. A lot of times they don't, it just goes away, and that's what they wanted it to happen.

They definitely are getting a positive public impression.

This last one is new. What we came with last year -- and this also segues into the biodegradable plastics -- is a lot of thinks venues -- they focus on and a lot of their revenue actually comes, not from ticket

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

sales, but from sponsorships, where people sponsor a player, sponsor something. And then the sign goes up. And then the camera focuses in on home plate or it focuses in on the serve in the tennis or the basketball court, and you see a sign with somebody's name. That's a sponsorship.

The sponsorships are millions, literally -- millions and millions of dollars. They're very -- there's about 17-page contracts with just -- that isn't the whole contract. That is just the deals on how the sponsorships work.

What the Tennis Garden did this year is we went and they actually said, "Okay. We really think this is good, what you're doing here. And we're going to open up a different kind of sponsorship that we're going to call Environmental sponsorship Concept." We're currently bouncing back before -- between Coca-Cola and Dow Cargill that makes the PLA, the biodegradable plastic, to see if we can get a sponsorship.

And how those work would be Coke would be the complete -- there would be no other soft drink products in the venue. The venues also tie together where they in Indian Wells, they play in Miami, and then they move on to New York. And so we're just saying -- in essence, the deal is, "Coca-Cola, if you'll help us with the PLA, you

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

get to serve Coke in those three venues exclusively."

Dow Cargill, going through the same process with them.

I have a little note here. This is why I only get occasionally invited to do these things, because they never know what I'm really going to say.

I have note: "Do not try any coercion. Remember, these folks deal with major players in both the literal and figurative sense." I don't know if you've ever met a player's agent. But they are really tough. And if you go into a venue and say, "I really think you need to do this," you probably won't be there that long. They're really skilled at getting rid of people and things and situations that they don't want. But they really will help you because they're very gung-ho at general and junkie types that like to do exciting new things. So they will help you if you work with them. And if you try to pull, "Ah, no, we have to do this," by and large it won't work with them.

--o0o--

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: The biodegradable plastics came from the failure in the food court. And, again, that's not a word you're supposed to use on a panel, but I will.

We had 30 percent -- less than 25 percent of the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

material. And we looked at what was there. And all it was was plastic. It was plastic forks, spoons, knives, et cetera, with some food on it.

We tied that together with the sponsorship opportunities, and we saw that it could impact all venues significantly and get rid of the rest of the waste. And you could almost get to a 90-percent diversion. And so we committed to the concept of getting biodegradable plastics introduced into the venues.

I'm going to wrap it up there. There's a lot more to talk about biodegradable plastics. But John needs to tell you about his composting.

And I'll finish up there.

(Applause.)

MS. KINSELLA: Thank you, William. That is another subject altogether.

I'd like to introduce John Beerman now. And I'm sure John had a wonderful presentation for us today. But his computer wasn't able to talk to our computer, so we didn't get it. But we will attempt to get his slides at a later date and get them on our website as well, under the Board meetings website, along with all the other presentations.

So, anyway, John Beerman is the Vice President of Sales and Marketing for California Biomass, Incorporated,

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

which is a southern California composter, with operations in Thermal and Victorville.

And as we've heard for both the Tennis Gardens food diversion contract and for the food diversion component of the Desert Sands school grant, John has offered technical assistance and support above and beyond the call of duty.

Please welcome John Beerman.

(Applause.)

PANEL MEMBER BEERMAN: Thank you very much. It's too bad we're not going to see these pictures of the food waste that I brought -- or that I was going to show you today, because it was some really awful looking stuff. I mean you would have really enjoyed it. Not like that beautiful pristine stuff that Jack and Chris showed you. I mean I had some really ugly, monstrous-looking stuff.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER BEERMAN: Which leads me into -- I want to say, first of all, that California Biomass is a organics receiver and recycler in southern California. We've had the thermal facility for a little over eight years. It's a permitted -- fully permitted facility. And we've been doing predominantly green waste, which in the whole scheme of composting is a relatively easy -- it's usually very neatly source separated. We get most of the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

product in, even from the curbside program, which is relatively clean of contaminants. And Waste Management's done a great job of doing education on the curbside program. And then we've got some large landscapers that bring in very clean and pristine green waste. So we've been used to having an easy go of composting.

And I'm going to talk to you today very frankly about the role of the composter as a compost producer, as a guy that -- as a company that needs to receive this and do something when we're talking about food scraps.

Let me start out by saying that the first time -- and we've been doing food waste for I guess about four years now. And the first -- and I'm not going to say that this pertains to William's projects at the tennis garden necessary. But certainly we've had some pilot programs that have been eye opening to me as a composter. I can say the first day that we had the truck show up -- the Waste Management truck with the compaction container, and we all got out there with the cameras and all anticipating -- it was about 110 degrees in Thermal. That's why they call it Thermal.

And they opened up the back door, and out comes this flood of odoriferous liquid undescribable mess, that was followed by the sound of breaking glass as the loads in bags landed on the ground. And my immediate thought

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

was, "What in the world did we get ourselves into?" And the second thought was, "Who in the heck's going to clean up this mess," you know, because all my guys turned and ran.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER BEERMAN: The next thing I thought was, Uh oh, there goes my OMRI certification," and "Please, God, don't let a compost customer show up today."

So after I got through all those initial, you know, thoughts of, you know, "Why am I doing this for the sake of food scrap recycling?", I may say that it has evolved into a very good experience for California Biomass working with the cities, Waste Management, and EcoNomics and all the companies that are producing food scraps.

Now, we haven't really gone to the level that the San Francisco -- City of San Francisco has gotten to. But we're -- I feel confident we're on the way.

Now, quickly I want to get into some of the questions that I was asked to respond to regarding the Tennis Garden and particularly contamination. Basically that's the number one question, "How much contamination was there in the food scraps collected?" And initially, as William mentioned, it was a horrifying experience. I mean it came in, stuff came out. There was glass. There was I think a chair, some cushions, a lot of indescribable

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

stuff; and I knew things that were not going to make the best compost.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER BEERMAN: So, you know, I understand that in this whole scheme of things from a receiver of food waste, food scraps, we have to look at the source of that material, and then how it is actually managed at the source. The source-separation management is key to making a successful program. From the beginning to the end, you've got to have fairly clean material out of the venue that it's being produced or the curbside program or the restaurant program or the hotel resort program. And that requires a lot of work and training and a lot of involvement on many levels.

Once that material comes in -- and may I say, since the beginning of the food scrap program -- recycling program at the Indian Wells Tennis Garden, we have seen a marked improvement, in fact to the point where it's just great. I mean it comes in, I commingle the food scraps with green waste. And we immediately get into the composting cycle. There's at this point a minimal cleaning.

In the beginning we had to suit the guys up with paper jumpsuits, mask, glasses, gloves, boots, and wade into that mess and open the bags. In fact, I was the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

first guy to do it to show them I would do it before they would do it. And then I had to give them a little spiff to do the program.

And now that it's -- I mean it's particularly difficult in the heat. I may go back to that one more time.

There's -- the other issue that we have to deal with is vector problems. You know, we certainly are going to see a lot more flies. We don't have any rats or necessarily that many birds. But vectors are a situation. So you've got to take that food waste and very quickly, within 12 to 24 hours, get that into the composting process.

Odor's always an issue. It lands at the site odoriferous. You've got to have an odor control program, which we have brought in, and use an organic odor control product that's outstanding -- and we even use it at the that tennis gardens -- called Odor ACE.

And so we do -- you have to have an odor-control program.

You've got to remember, in being a composter, you've got to be a good neighbor. And there's a question coming up about, "Why don't other composters take this on?" And the biggest issue I think is, "Is it going to affect me being a good neighbor, because I'm bringing in

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

things that are obviously going to be a possible contamination problem and an odor problem?"

But as it turns out, if you manage your systems properly in receiving food scraps, it ends up not to be a problem.

Considering our experience with the Desert Sands Unified School District and the elementary schools that we are receiving their lunch program food scraps from, it's very clean material, less than 1 percent contamination, and is a lot of paper, and it composts like a dream. You co-compost that. It's gone. Not a problem whatsoever to compost those materials.

I wanted to get to some specifics regarding contamination at the -- and some of the testing we did that the Waste Board asked us to do. And EcoNomics and the city also was interested. We found that the kitchen waste and the waste coming from the Tennis Garden was about 98 percent clean. So very little contamination. The contaminants that were left was usually plastic, very little glass. So we had an easy time of it.

One interesting thing though was that we were asked to do a test program on the food court material that was not really gone through the recycling -- had not gone through the recycling or the source-separation program. They just put it in bags. We collected about 100 -- small

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

amount, I'll give you -- that's 135 pounds of material.

I just buried it in the processing green waste that was -- I mean that was in process, and kept it there for 60 days. We exhumed this -- we exhumed this food waste and other products, which included biodegradable cups, biodegradable some flatware, and some tableware. We also had -- let me get back to this.

So those were included. But along with that were non-biogradable plastic materials. And we exhumed that. And out of the 35 pounds we ended up with a net of 9 pounds after it was all done of materials that were not composted. So I was actually quite surprised. All the paper was gone. There wasn't any glass, which was our biggest concern. And there was very little post -- I mean that was what we could consider a post-consumer waste test. And we had less than 10-percent contamination -- well under 10-percent contamination in that trial. And so I feel a little bit better about that.

We're also working on doing some composting tests for the biodegradable Biocorp utensils versus stuff off the shelf. And that's for another talk.

The other contamination that -- the contamination that's already been talked about mostly that affects composters is glass. And the reason is it's hard to get out of the compost -- once it's commingled, once it's in

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

the waste stream, if you don't pick it out at the time it hits the yard, you've got it in your compost. And you can imagine if somebody buys a bag of compost or gets a load of compost that's got shards of glass in it, it's a big negative. So that is my number one problem with glass.

Plastic. Plastic is only a problem because a lot of stuff comes in plastic bags. If it comes in plastic bags, you need to break the bags open and get the material that needs to be composted out of the bag before you can commingle it and get it into the composting program, or it won't compost thoroughly in the time period you've made for it.

Metal is fairly easy to pull out. You know, we get to number 10 cans and those types of things. But we can pull those. At both of our facilities we have a picking station. So after the initial composting of four to six months happens, we screen it and we hand pick any non-compostables out of the stream of material before it's reground and sent back to further composting.

So we are set up in California Biomass to do those things. A lot of composters aren't. A lot of composters just comes in and they grind it and they put in a windrow. And when it's done, they screen it and off it goes. They don't have a system in place to pick non-compostables out of the feed stocks.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

We've done some experiments on styrofoam. Styrofoam's another thing that doesn't biodegrade easily. There is some new products coming out that may help that.

We've had other issues with light bulbs, filters and miscellaneous stuff, as I mentioned before. Chairs, mattresses, cushions, light fixtures, and a lawn mower.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER BEERMAN: Oh, and a golf cart. I got a golf cart one time. Very hard to compost golf carts.

Okay. The third is: Do biodegradable -- let's see -- oh, do the food service biodegradable products biodegrade properly? For instance, the Biocorp products and the other products on the market? And my -- and my -- and I say, yes, they do. They compost extremely well and leave no residual. And I've seen great results from the biodegradable food service products.

Is compost quality compromised by adding food waste?

And the answer to that is, no, it's not compromised at all. In fact, you do increase the end value, the nitrogen value depending on how much and where your food waste comes from. So the compost which we test monthly, when we send out our tests that we keep records of, all of the compost has stayed very good quality. I've

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

seen no effect -- negative effects to our compost quality whatsoever. And that's good news for our many organic customers.

Okay. The barriers I may have mentioned earlier. The barriers of setting up a food scraps program is really decontaminating the food scraps, depending on the source separation or depending on the source of where the food scraps are coming from. If they're doing a good job at the source, there's very little a composter needs to do to make the program work.

If it's not a good -- if there's not a good system, then the composter is saddled with the obligation of adding a lot more -- I would say a significant increase in plant and labor, and to protect the workers as well, and an odor-control program to handle food waste effectively and on a long-term basis. So it all depends on the material that we get in.

There's a lot of training that needs to be done to handle it safely. So we're -- of course that also is one of the things that needs to be handled.

I was asked what of our compost markets for the -- the primary markets for the composting we produce from the food scraps and co-compost with green waste, is agriculture. We're in a wonderful agricultural area, a lot of grape growers, vegetable growers, dates, citrus.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

And 70 percent of the compost we produce, which is about 40,000 tons a year, goes out and -- and, by the way, everything we produce goes out to the market. We could actually increase the amount of compost sold a year if we could produce more.

Golf courses and resorts. There's 120 golf courses in The Coachella Valley. And they love our double-screened top dressing compost. Landscapers -- and that's about 20 percent of our market is golf courses and resorts. Ten percent is the landscape industry. And there's a fraction of the homeowners that have heard about us. We don't advertise to them. We do do a giveaway program three or four times a year through Riverside County, and we get some homeowners to come in the yard and we give them compost for their back yards.

There's a question about what amount of food scraps makes it worthwhile to a composter -- or makes it worthwhile to pick up? Well, first of all, we don't pick it up. So that's not part of the equation as far as we're concerned. And it really doesn't matter what the tonnage is. We can take a small amount or a large amount. The larger amount, the more we have to plan for it. But we could take a small amount in different times if it is predominantly a clean feed stock. If it's a clean feed stock, we have no trouble taking it at any time. It's not

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

a problem.

Again, another question is: What are the major contaminants? Of course, number one is glass. It's unacceptable. If there's glass in the load -- and I have a little test now. It's called the smash-tinkle-tinkle test. So when I go -- when the food waste truck comes in and the doors open and I hear, "Smash tinkle tinkle," I know there's a problem. So I got to go up -- I don't even have to open the bag. I just go up and make the call and say, you know, "We can't go on like this."

The percent of plastic contamination that is acceptable -- you know, we don't want a high percentage of contamination of any kind. Plastic is easier to manage -- again, the biggest part of the plastic -- the part that is not acceptable is because there's bags. If it comes not in bags, then we're in great shape.

The other stuff we can pick because we're set up for it. Other composters that aren't set up to pick the feed stocks may have more of a problem.

And, finally, compost -- you know, the question is: Why don't more composters want to do food scrap programs?

And I will just reiterate some of the things I've already said. Compost quality is most important to a compost producer, because without back-end marketing

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

you're out of business. The stuff comes into your facility. You've got to make a quality product and you've got to be able to sell it. If something comes into that stream that you're accepting which contaminates your product, you're defeating the whole purpose of being in business. So that's a number one problem with getting more composters involved.

Other composters have a very sensitive area that they're composting in, whether -- they may have neighbors that complain often. And if they bring in another feed stock that has a propensity to be odoriferous, then maybe they don't want to do it because of that situation.

I kind I go back to what Christopher said. There's kind of a 10-80-10 rule that I think also would apply to composters. Ten percent of composters say, "I don't want to mess with it because it's going to rock my boat." Eighty percent would probably do it if they could see that -- you know, that they could do it profitably and it wouldn't affect their operations. And then there's 10 percent that are ready to do this and they want to do it and they see it's important for the community and they're going to be behind it 110 percent. I'm one of those guys.

With that, I'll say goodbye. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. KINSELLA: Thank you, John.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

That brings us to our question and answer session.

And Trevor O'Shaughnessy will be moderating that.

Oh, I just wanted to make one announcement.

All of our panelists' contact information will be on the Board's website.

For those of you in our audience right now, if you've grabbed a page, looks like Rosemary's E-mail address is incorrect. Where it says KQW, it should be K12.

Okay. And Trevor will announce --

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: Hi, everybody. My name's Trevor O'Shaughnessy with the Integrated Waste Management Board as well.

And just a couple of things. First off, we did announce this workshop as ending at 4:15. We're coming up to that hour. That is not to say we're concluding at this point. We will go through our Q and A session. Our Internet is up and going. We are accepting questions through the E-mail address that's been provided several times to you, that are listening on-line. If you're on-line and we went over your time limits, we apologize for that, and we hope that this workshop was beneficial and useful for you.

If you do have questions at another time that

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

you're not submitting at this time, please still submit them. And we'll do our best to respond to anyone that gives us either an E-mail response, and we'll do a broadband, or we'll just put them on our website as an overall Q and A or question and answer from the workshop.

With that, I'm going to kind of do something a little different. I'm going to start out with a question from the Internet rather than the audience, just because they're out there. And the first question is going to be for Christopher Williams of Applied Composting Consulting. This question, from Andrea Rodriguez. And the question is:

What and how are educational/promotional materials in supporting the SBC Park's waste diversion programs presented to the park's visitors?

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Well, that's a good question. We are not working very much with the public-side recycling due to the potential contamination issues out there. So all of the information that the public is getting about what's going on with recycling at the park is being done through the public relations mechanism of the Giants and the awards that they're getting and whatnot.

We are eager to move to public-side recycling. But that needs to be in association with a picking line.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

As William O'Toole said, at the tennis facility you find that the actual tonnage of materials that's recoverable is fairly low. The contamination level's extremely high. You know, I've been at special events where people see the little circular hole in the top of the recycling bin and they think, "Oh, well, disposable diapers, if you roll them up just so, they just fit right through there." So, you know, that's the kind of thing that you get a lot.

I hope that answers the question.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: I think it does. And generally it's just a very difficult audience to work with. And you do your best, not only to generally work with the employee base, but do your best to deliver the message to those that really want to know at this point, and you'll slowly expand the program.

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: Also, at venues that serve alcohol, it gets more and more difficult as the game progresses.

(Laughter.)

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: For those in our audience, we do have two roving microphones. If you just want to raise your hand, we'll get your question for you.

We do ask that you state your name, because we do have a court reporter here trying to capture everything from this workshop. So if you could state your name. If

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

you have a business card, if you can just give it to us. If you don't have a business card, if you could just spell your name for the record, that would be appreciated.

There's a question in the back.

MS. NICOLE: My name is Anastasia Nicole. I had a question for -- is it Melissa, the blond in --

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: That would be Rosemary.

MS. NICOLE: Oh, I'm sorry, Rosemary. I can't read the names from here.

You said earlier some of the materials you're recycling, and you mentioned styrofoam. How are you recycling styrofoam?

PANEL MEMBER MINDIOLA: Yeah, actually Valerie and I had a conversation about that up here, because we were told -- and I think it was not Deborah. I think it was the previous recycling coordinator before you came on to Waste Management told us that we could recycle styrofoam. And we've been putting it in our recycling bins. But she now tells me that they're not recycling it at their facility. So we're going to look at that when we get back.

MS. NICOLE: Yeah, thank your for clarifying that, because as far as I knew there were very few places in the state or even in the country that are recycling styrofoam.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

So just wanted to get that straight.

MR. LISS: Gary Liss. Probably for Jack Macy. But anyone else chime in.

On the particular biodegradables being used, there's been some disturbing news of the use of GMO, genetically modified, food going into biodegradables. And I stopped promoting biodegradables because I'm really concerned about the mixed messages of: Is this the environmentally most appropriate way to go?

On the other hand, for special events particularly, if biodegradables is available, it makes a whole lot of sense.

But I'm really nervous about what is the message. So you referred to BPI as someone that in your presentation you looked to as setting the standard. Are they the ones that we should be working with on the GMO issue and other concerns?

PANEL MEMBER MACY: Yeah, we've been concerned about GMO as well. My understanding is that most of the bags, for example, that are on the market have been from resin in Europe, which is not GMO. That's the matter B resin. There are some new products that have been coming along, and they tend to actually be more petroleum-based. So I'm actually not aware of any bags that are GMO-based.

Cargill Dow's polylactic acid, PLA, is from corn

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

in the U.S., which to me it's likely to be GMO, since most the corn grown in the U.S. is GMO. They say that the process -- because the GMO is in the, as I understand, in the protein, that the process of making the polylactic acid and the clear compostable plastic -- the clear compostable plastic does not have GMO. So there's not a concern about that in terms of the final product. But in terms of the source of the material, they do have an option called source offset, where you can if you're a buyer -- and the bigger the buyer you are, the better -- you can say, well, we want to have the equivalent quantity that we're buying to be offset by dedicated purchases of non-GMO.

And I just recently asked them that question about what the impact of that was financially, because there is a higher cost apparently, to non-GMO versus GMO. And I haven't heard yet. And I just sort of asked that question.

So they do seem to have an option to address it. But there are I think concerns -- environmental concerns around corn production. It's a very energy, petroleum and, you know, pesticide, so forth, intensive operation. So I think it's just a matter of balances.

But Cargill Dow has a very detailed life cycle analysis that they've done that they have on their

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

website. And, you know, they've addressed some of the issues, but I don't believe they addressed the GMO as part of that.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: Have an additional response from Terry Brennan.

MR. BRENNAN: There are also other types of compostable or biodegradable products you can get made from bamboo, wheat-based. You know, you can go back to paper products too for a lot of those things and use those. Or try to serve foods that require less food serviceware too.

Some of the products that you're going to want to use though, you're not going to be able to find in some of those other -- some of those types of products.

My understanding was that the PLA products from Cargill Dow, they couldn't get enough corn that was non-GMO in order to use and the size of the plant that they have in Nebraska. And that was one of the reasons that they stick with that.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: Okay. We have another question that came in from our cyber audience. And the question is from Marialyce -- and I apologize if I mispronounce that -- Pedersen from the Disneyland Resort. And the question is: They really want to implement a composting program, but can't find a leakproof

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

transportation system to move wet organic materials from one area of the park to another in order to consolidate materials for shipment to a composting facility. Are there are any suggestions on cost effective or neat transportation mechanisms to move wet materials?

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: The wheeled carts we've been using at Pac Bell Park, manufactured by Toter, have served that purpose. Because the luxury suites have a very high aesthetic threshold that needs to be met. And I would say that using, you know, a tough molded plastic container like that -- and I'll go one step and farther, that then say that the rotomolded interior collection bins are much more durable than the injection molded single-walled bins, you know, that have been used traditionally as the slim Jim type containers in kitchens.

So choosing a fairly tough, you know, molded plastic wheeled cart or slim Jim type container in the first place. And then visual inspections of those containers as the sanitation cycle is done. Because it's important -- you know, one answer to your question, Gary, is what's the alternative to GMO plastic, it's going liner-less.

And if you can set up your facility as Pac Bell or SBC Park has done to a large degree to not even use liners, then you have an opportunity to inspect the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

containers every time they're sanitized. And any that are cracked or whatnot should be pulled out of service and replaced with other ones. So you don't find out that they're leaking, you know, when they're leaking nasty stuff on your carpet. You find out when they're being cleaned.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: I have a question in the audience.

MR. GREALY: Yes, Steve Grealy with the City of San Diego.

The first question is on the percentage -- I think it was 56 percent of the SBC Park was the recycling rate for SBC Park. And I was wondering if you could give a breakout of what that 56 percent was comprised of by food, various other -- cardboard.

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: No, I don't.

I'm going to -- Chris Levaujey's in the audience, and he represents the hauler. So he would probably have a much better idea of the exact percentages.

Let me say, first of all, the 56 percent was an estimate that came from the hauler and does not include materials that aren't handled by the hauler. I know there's a lot of sensitivity in the audience to, you know, a numbers counting game for diversion sake that includes lots of rocks and dirt. You know, the people are

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

questioning whether that should be in there at all.

There is a lot of diversion via rocks and dirt at SBC Park because they do monster trucks and motocross in the off season. And they take all of that soil that's used for those events -- essentially the heavy plastic liner goes down on the playing field and then plywood sheeting and then lots and lots of soil. That soil's moved out to the parking lot during the regular season and tarped and then reused season after season.

We're still trying to get an estimate on exactly how much material that is. But obviously that's many, many tons. That's not in the 56-percent figure.

Also sod, the playing field is stripped down to, you know, an inch or so below the turf. And that soil and turf is removed by the sod supplier. It's ground up into a homogenous mixture and backhauled to the Central Valley, where it's used to grow the next generation of sod.

But contained within the 56 percent that is counted is probably about 600 tons total a year. I'm estimating a couple hundred tons of that is corrugated cardboard, probably a hundred tons each of beverage containers and office paper. And the remainder, which would be another couple of hundred tons, would be food scraps.

But like I said, Chris Levaggi might be able to

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

give you a better answer than that.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: William O'Toole had something to add.

PANEL MEMBER O'TOOLE: Yes, Steve. I can give you some exact numbers for 2004, which was: There was a total of 28.01 tons diverted. And that was 14.09 tons of cardboard; 3.34 tons of commingled recyclables, meaning plastic and aluminum and so forth; and 10.58 tons of food scraps. And then for 2004 you add that all up. It's 28.01.

The total disposed was 66.52, total generated 94.53, for 29.63 diverted. And the same materials are in stadiums, so that should be somewhat usable for what you want.

MR. GREALY: Thank you, yeah. And just one comment on the GMO. Since most of the corn and the soy and the canola grown in the states is now genetically modified, the food's going to be genetically modified. So, you know, whether the cutlery is or not is not really going to be such an issue.

And also, you know, the fescue grass they're coming out with genetically modified grass now on the lawns. So the green waste is going to be genetically modified as well.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: All right. We have another

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

question from the Internet.

The question specifically says: What are the first three steps that you would give as recommending to start a program in a junior or senior high school? And I'm going to make that a little bit more generic and say: What are the first steps you would do for doing any program in a school setting -- the first three steps that you would consider or recommend to do?

PANEL MEMBER MINDIOLA: The first thing is you need to talk to the staff. Because if you don't have their buy-in, it's not going to work. So that's the first thing.

And then you need to look at the set up of the site to see what kind of containers are going to fit best there, where they're going to be placed. And I think the primary thing you really have to look at is is that the custodial staff at schools are strapped to the edges. Where they used to have 15 minutes to clean a room, they have 3. And they're running and running and running. You cannot give them more work to do. So you have to find a way to -- whatever you do, not put more work on their shoulders. So showing them that it's either going to be easier, lightening the load for them, or no more work is a key to having it successful.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: Steven.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

PANEL MEMBER SHERMAN: I'd like to add in a model that we're working with in Alameda County. The Alameda County Waste Management Authority for many years was supporting recycling efforts at individual schools, and recently has moved to test out a different model, which is to work with school districts on a district-by-district level.

So they work from the superintendent level down and get a memorandum of understanding between the superintendent of the district and the Alameda County Waste Management Authority. Once that's in place, then the Alameda County Waste Management Authority provides technical assistance and other types of assistance. They provide some monetary incentives as well. And by getting that top level buy-in, then that gets distributed down through the principals.

And then a corollary to that is to work from the bottom rung up, once we get that top level buy-in, is to work predominantly with the custodians at a school level or the custodial services department within a district and to train them and to elevate their status within the school to become stewards, resource managers. And they are literally and figuratively the keeper of the keys. And that's quite a powerful position to have in a school. And so they become a key component of the success of the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

program long term.

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: I just wanted to add to that briefly to say that the custodians are not expected to haul all the materials. And, in fact, at a lot of the school sites it's a coordinated event where the students are doing most of the heavy lifting. But the custodians are the ones that are basically the facilitators and monitors of the program. They're the ones that are dealing with the hauler interface and, you know, the collection areas.

And it's in their best interest to have a school that's energized about recycling, because those are lower litter schools, and also to keep the dumpster areas clean by making sure that the materials are being correctly emptied into those --

PANEL MEMBER MINDIOLA: Well, I do want to say one thing though is that, while our program is district wide and that's the reason why it's been so successful, you can't lose site of the individuality of every school and their particular needs and their particular make up of how they run together as a unit. Because if you do, it's not going to work. You can't blanketly say this is the way it's going to be at every school, do it or else, because it will just fail. You have to look at what their particular needs are and suit the program for them, even

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

though it is a district-wide program.

PANEL MEMBER MACY: I have a quick follow-up too. For San Francisco, we've also been successful with the food composting. And in addition to working down from the management level, funding local champions and schools and customizing the program. And then we have a whole branding food to flowers, with a mascot and a whole range of educational material and tying into the curriculum. So that's also been successful. But I think the involvement of motivated teachers, janitors, and especially the students is really beneficial on a number of levels, from educational to program viability.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: Question in the audience?

MS. PETERSON: Dorothy Peterson, Davis Joint Unified School District garden recycle coordinator.

We have a little bit different concern. We've been recycling, composting in all the elementary schools, all 9 of them out of 14 total for the last five years. We have a combination of a hot lunch and a crunch lunch salad bar. They have just finished building a new central kitchen. If you were to have a magic ball and you would say what are the first three things that we need to look at this central kitchen in a good roll-out for a recycling program, composting program, at the central kitchen site, because they're going to be marketing out to the other

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

school sites, both junior high, high school, and elementary; what do we need, because it's opening up March 1st?

Help.

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER MINDIOLA: It is a big question. I think one of the key things -- and I found this out when we did the waste audit with the waste -- California Integrated Waste Management Board was that our central kitchen, which serves 28 sites, is so close to zero waste, that I was amazed. They do a count right up to the point of where the food is about to be delivered to the school sites. So that there's relatively nothing thrown away.

About the only thing -- and we're working on that right now -- is the plastic shrink wrap that comes in some of the palletized deliveries.

But everything else that comes out of there is recycled.

Most of the vegetables and fruit we receive are already ready for preparation. And we have the food lines where they work and they package the food.

The only thing I would say is that -- and that's something that we want to do ourselves -- is if we can find biodegradable containers to put the cold pack in, that would make us a lot happier. And that includes the

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

film that goes across the top.

The bottom containers can be recycled. But it's the film -- and every one of them is covered with that film -- that winds up being thrown away. And I think they put out about 12,000 lunches a day and 12,000 breakfasts. So that's an awful lot of that plastic that's just going into the trash.

So ideally that would be where you would want to start is looking at the containers that the food is going to go in.

The hot pack is all composted except for the film on the top. And that's still going out to the school sites. So whatever waste is happening from the schools with the students, that can be composted.

Most school districts do offer verse serve now. Where they used to on the free and reduced lunch program all kids had to take every part of the free or reduced lunch. Now they can choose a certain amount of items of that. However, milk is still an issue. The kids have to take the milk. And even if a kid is allergic to milk and they can't drink it, then the whole carton goes into the trash.

So I think that's something that needs to be changed legislatively. I don't think it's something that we can handle on a local level.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: We're going to go down to the last questions, just to wrap up, one from the audience and one from the Internet.

We'll go with the audience one first please.

MS. OWEN: Hello. I'm Lisa Owen. And that's L-i-s-a O-w-e-n for the stenographer.

The company I'm with is Cargill Dow, and we make Nature Works PLA. And there's been a lot of question and discussion around GMO here in the room this afternoon. And I'd just like to take a minute to kind of make sure that the facts are --

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: If you're trying to make a clarification, I cannot accept that at this point. If you have a question for our panel, that's fine. But if you're trying to clarify --

MS. OWEN: I'd really like to clarify. But If we don't have time --

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: -- we'll do that at the conclusion of the workshop. And if --

MS. OWEN: Sure, sure. In writing perhaps to the group back.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: You could do -- yeah, actually that would be wonderful you could provide a written clarification. We'll put that as an attachment -- as a follow-up to all the proceedings of this meeting.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

And that would be greatly appreciated.

MS. OWEN: Will do, because there were some misinformation that --

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: I understand, and it can happen a lot.

So our last question from the Internet is lost because I pushed the wrong button.

Hold on.

It's going to be summarized as such. "I'm transporting 20 cubic yards or more of very wet material. How do I store it without it getting all over my facility?" Without giving a brand name of a product, is there something out there to store 20 yards or more of wet waste?

PANEL MEMBER BEERMAN: Well, I would construct a bunker --

(Laughter.)

PANEL MEMBER BEERMAN: -- that he could store it in -- or he or she or whoever it might be, or they. I would put it in a bunker which had a capacity to hold any liquids or to be able to drain off those liquids so they wouldn't get off into the surrounding area. That would be the only way to store it.

And if it's odoriferous in any way, then it should be covered or an odor agent should be used to keep

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

it from having -- making it a problem before it's shipped.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: How about if I add clarification.

How do you legally transport wet waste down the highway without it spraying on the cars behind you?

PANEL MEMBER RIDDLE: Well, I believe there -- we have some 20 yard roll-offs. And they're water tight and sealed. They have lids. And that's what we've been using for our food waste. And they're also good for your street sweepers for the water. So I would think that those -- we don't have a problem with those. So --

PANEL MEMBER WILLIAMS: It would be good to know what the accumulation rate is too. Because if it's accumulating fairly rapidly, there's a high volume of material, the compactor sometimes can go to organics and the compactor can -- you know, can be selected to be leak proof.

MR. O'SHAUGHNESSY: Well, we'll provide to our panelists the specific business that asked this question so that they can have direct follow-up. But it sounds like there are containers out there that are water tight, so to speak, to assure that leakage does not come out for not only on-site storage but also for the transportation, both short and long term.

Well, at this point I'd like to thank everyone

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

for participating in our workshop. If you have any additional questions or if you would like to provide any additional information to us, you could please send E-mails to Chris Kinsella. And that E-mail's going to be C-K-I-N-S-E-L-L at C-I-W-M-B dot C-A dot G-O-V. That's CKINSELL@CIWMB.CA.GOV.

Again, from the Waste Management Board, we really appreciate your participation. We thank you for your questions from the Internet. And that wraps up this portion of the question and answer period.

I now will give it to Chris Kinsella to do her final wrap up.

MS. KINSELLA: Thank you, Trevor.

Am I on?

We have one last wrap-up slide. I just wanted to tell the people and the listening audience and the people here that we will again have all the resources on our web. It will be under "Board meetings". Look for the December 8th date. And we will be sure to put all the presentations there and the handouts and the contact information. There will be audio tapes available of the proceedings. And transcripts as well.

And, again, if you had a question and you didn't get your card to the person with the microphone, please bring your card down to the court reporter here.

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

And how about a big round of applause for our panelists.

(Applause.)

Thank you so much for coming. We really appreciate you taking the time to come here.

Thank you.

(Thereupon the California Integrated Waste Management Board, Food Waste Diversion at Large Public Venues Workshop adjourned at 4:40 p.m.)

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

I, JAMES F. PETERS, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of California, and Registered Professional Reporter, do hereby certify:

That I am a disinterested person herein; that the foregoing California Integrated Waste Management Board, Food Waste Diversion at Large Public Venues workshop was reported in shorthand by me, James F. Peters, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of California, and thereafter transcribed into typewriting.

I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for any of the parties to said workshop nor in any way interested in the outcome of said workshop.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 21st day of December, 2004.

JAMES F. PETERS, CSR, RPR
Certified Shorthand Reporter
License No. 10063